



## For Action with Confidential Attachment

### State of Good Repair - Decision to Proceed with Work

**Date:** November 16, 2020  
**To:** TTC Board  
**From:** Chief of Infrastructure and Engineering

#### Reason for Confidential Information

---

This report contains information about labour relations.

#### Summary

---

The purpose of this report is to report back on the TTC operational decision as to whether to proceed with a 10-day closure on a portion of Line 1 (Finch - Sheppard), for which the TTC obtained delegated authority from the Board in October 2020, to award a contract to a third party of up to \$8 million inclusive of all taxes in order to perform large scale asbestos abatement.

The TTC has decided to proceed with engaging the use of a third party contractor to perform large scale asbestos abatement on a portion of Line 1. This is being considered primarily due to the decreased ridership levels in light of the COVID-19 pandemic.

#### Recommendations

---

It is recommended that the Board:

1. Receive this report for information;
2. Receive the confidential attachment for information and that the information in the confidential attachment remain confidential as it deals with labour relations matters.

#### Implementation Points

---

The TTC outlined its plans in considering a 10-day closure for the period of December 4 - 14, 2020 from Finch Station to Sheppard Station, with an early closure planned for Friday, December 4, 2020, during the October Board meeting:

[http://www.ttc.ca/About the TTC/Commission reports and information/Commission meetings/2020/October 22/Reports/4 State of Good Repair Delegation to the CEO for the Asbesto.pdf](http://www.ttc.ca/About%20the%20TTC/Commission%20reports%20and%20information/Commission%20meetings/2020/October%2022/Reports/4%20State%20of%20Good%20Repair%20Delegation%20to%20the%20CEO%20for%20the%20Asbesto.pdf).

A RFI was issued on September 21, 2020, seeking interest for a vendor to perform large scale asbestos removal on a portion of Line 1 within the above noted closure. A site tour was conducted on September 27, 2020 with ten vendors attending, and responses to the RFI were received September 30, 2020.

The tunnel structure targeted for asbestos removal is composed of flat wall surfaces, with areas of extensive cabling responsible for train signals and traction power, along with communication systems for safe train routing. Having contractors perform asbestos removal around and near cabling brings the risk of cable damage that could impact subway service. As such, the TTC is focusing the contractor's work on asbestos removal on flat wall surfaces only to avoid removal in and around the said cables.

A formal RFP was issued on October 7, 2020 seeking a vendor to perform the work in question. Further site visits were conducted on October 18, 2020. The RFP was scheduled to close on November 3, 2020 and was extended to November 5, 2020, and evaluations occurred subsequently. A negotiation timeline concludes November 23, 2020, following which the successful proponent will need to mobilize in order to be prepared for the closure scheduled to commence December 4, 2020.

A more in depth review considering the costs and risks associated with the closure, in conjunction with the opportunity to accelerate the abatement program and decrease risk to unforeseen service disruptions was conducted. Various risk mitigation strategies continue to be developed (e.g., cable protection, site monitoring, readily available emergency supplies, TTC response plans etc.) and will be incorporated in the final site plans.

## **Financial Summary**

---

Eight million for this expenditure is available in the TTC's 2020 Approved Capital Budget under Program 6.1 Environmental Programs – Subway Asbestos Removal Program. An in-year budget adjustment was approved by the TTC Board at its meeting of May 13, 2020, and subsequently by City Council, that accelerated funding from within the Program's planned estimates in the 2020-2029 Capital Plan to 2020, in order to leverage the opportunity of lower ridership on the system due to COVID-19 and undertake this capital work.

The Interim Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

## **Equity/Accessibility Matters**

---

A cornerstone of the TTC's Corporate Plan 2018-2022 is accessibility. As a proud leader in providing accessible public transit in the City of Toronto, we are committed to ensuring reliable, safe and inclusive transit services for all of our customers. We are planning to run a frequent service to minimize the delay to customers and to provide enough capacity to meet the demand.

## **Decision History**

---

Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, the TTC's daily ridership has been reduced significantly. This circumstance offers a rare opportunity to the TTC to accelerate planned state-of-good-repair ("SOGR") and asbestos abatement work on Line 1 without impacting customers in the manner it would, if ridership were at normal levels. The TTC has considered the various risks, benefits and costs associated with the project and has decided to proceed to contract a third party to perform large scale asbestos abatement on the flat surfaces contained within the box tunnel structure. Contractors will be obliged to protect cabling within the tunnels and given the complexity of the work surrounding the cabling which would result in lower productivity and enhanced risks will not perform that work. Notwithstanding this, it is estimated that the contractor workforce should be able to perform the work in 10-days, the equivalent amount of work it would realistically take the TTC force two to two and a half years of time to complete on regular shifts (flat wall surfaces only). This accounts for scheduling challenges due to competition for track time and resources.

In order to fully complete abatement in the area in question, still taking the opportunity of reduced ridership, the TTC will continue to review the opportunity to schedule 12-15 weeks of early access closures for the TTC forces to conclude the complex cabling work. Early access closures enable a quadrupling of TTC productivity over regular shifts due to elongated and consistent work periods. This prioritization of this asbestos removal state of good repair work within early access closures will reduce the period of time the TTC forces would ordinarily require to complete this complex work from 1.5 - 1.9 years during regular shifts to three - four months if all track level conflicts can be resolved.

Overall, with the TTC proceeding with both a 10-day closure with contractors performing abatement on flat wall surfaces, and early access closures for the TTC forces to conduct complex abatement surrounding cabling, the timeframe for abatement can be reduced from five - six years to three - four months in the North York Center to Finch Station territory.

The TTC will be providing shuttle service for customers along the corridor based on current ridership levels and respecting social distancing. The TTC continues to monitor ridership level and will do so up to contract award to ensure that a sufficient shuttle service respecting social distancing can be provided.

## **Issue Background**

---

### **Asbestos Abatement**

The TTC is challenged to maintain its assets and maintain its current SOGR schedules given the restricted nightly window to perform the work, which has led to delay, and impeded the progression of work on some of its critical SOGR work, including asbestos abatement, which poses risks to service and future initiatives, and which could result in future weekend closures that negatively impact customers.

Under a status quo scenario, it would take TTC employees between 64-80 regular shifts to complete the amount of asbestos abatement we are seeking to award to a third party contractor (flat surfaces only). This work can be scheduled regularly by the TTC however, there is a potential for work zone conflict due to competing demand for track level work during the normal short maintenance window which could result in a prolonged schedule. The current timeframe for the Asbestos Abatement Program within the North Yonge Corridor on Line 1 is well outside of the 10-year window. The work contemplated in this closure by the TTC should reduce this timeframe by at least two to two and a half years when accounting for these scheduling challenges. For example, due to competition for track access considering various projects underway, it would be virtually impossible to schedule concurrent shifts on regular nights. As such, the reality of scheduling challenges has been taken into consideration when arriving at this timeframe.

If we consider the complex cabling abatement, under status quo scenario, this entire space would likely take the TTC forces between five to six years to fully abate. By utilizing a contractor for flat surface wall asbestos removal and supplementing this with early access closures for the TTC forces asbestos removal, the entire timeframe in this area, could be reduced to three to four months.

## **Comments**

---

The work to be performed under this contract would be the abatement of box tunnel structure, north and south corridors, between North York Centre Station Platform and Church Street emergency exit. This represents a total of approximately 35,000 square feet of material to be abated. A range of reasonableness in terms of what can safely be abated during the short closure is being considered, and will be factored into the analysis.

A RFI was issued to the market on September 21, 2020. A site visit was conducted for 10 vendors, on September 27, 2020, with eight vendors providing a response to the RFI. The responses reflect varying cost estimates and completion rates.

A RFP was issued to the market on October 7, 2020 and closed on November 5, 2020. The negotiation period concludes November 23, 2020 at which time the successful proponent will mobilize to begin the project December 4, 2020. The contract award evaluation is based on a variety of factors with emphasis on ability to safely and reliably complete the work in question.

The TTC reviewed the project from a business and risk perspective. While there are operational risks associated with having the contractor perform such large scale abatement with power tools, for example damage to cabling, overall the TTC believes these risks have been sufficiently mitigated for the benefit of advancing the program to outweigh these risks. Mitigation measures include potential protection of powered cables in advance of contractor work commencing, a suitably trained TTC response team available throughout every hour of the closure, having readily available cable/hardware in close proximity for expedient repairs if required and close monitoring of contractor activities by field staff available throughout all contractor closure shifts.

Ridership levels being what they are in the face of the resurgence of the COVID-19 pandemic create a rare opportunity to advance the SOGR program. The key risk associated with this project is potential damage to cabling. For example, the cabling that runs within our tunnels cannot be turned off in order to maintain revenue service south of the closure. As such, there are significant risks should a contractor damage the cabling which would result in unanticipated service suspension or late closure removal. Risk mitigation measures have been developed and will be monitored.

The TTC has also been able to enhance its productivity through the mechanism of early closures, which in turn elongate the period of productive work for TTC employees. This is pivotal when dealing with the TTC's internal type three asbestos abatement procedure where the on-site set up with our abatement workcars can be carried out more than once per shift during an extended work window. The TTC will be continuing to explore project interdependencies and the opportunity to provide priority access to the asbestos abatement crew in order to conclude abatement in this area over 12-15 weeks of early access closures.

## **Contact**

---

Megan MacRae, Chief People Officer (Acting)  
416-220-7372  
[Megan.MacRae@ttc.ca](mailto:Megan.MacRae@ttc.ca)

Fortunato Monaco, Chief of Infrastructure and Engineering  
416- 393- 4406  
[Fortunato.Monaco@ttc.ca](mailto:Fortunato.Monaco@ttc.ca)

## **Signature**

---

Fortunato Monaco  
Chief of Infrastructure and Engineering

## **Attachment**

---

Confidential Attachment