



## Minutes

# Toronto Transit Commission Board

**Meeting No.:** 2043

**Meeting Date:** Wednesday, May 13, 2020

A virtual meeting of the TTC Board was held on Wednesday, May 13, 2020 commencing at 1:00 p.m. The meeting recessed at 3:36 p.m. to meet as the Committee of the Whole. The Board re-convened the public session at 4:11 p.m.

### Present at Committee of the Whole

J. De Laurentiis (Vice-Chair), B. Bradford, S. Carroll, A. Heisey, Q.C., J. Karygiannis, R. Lalonde, J. McKelvie, D. Minnan-Wong, J. Osborne (Commissioners), R. Leary, G. Downie, B. Hasserjian, J. La Vita, B. Leck, K. Llewellyn-Thomas, M. MacRae, G. Piemontese, N. Poole-Moffatt, S. Reed Tanaka, J. Ross, J. Taylor, K. Watson, R. Wong, M. Atlas, T. Bal, A. Cassar, A. Farnsworth, C. Finnerty, J. Ishak, K. Lee, S. Milloy.

F. Fernandes (Resolve Collaboration) and D. Magisano (Mayor's Office) were present.

J. De Laurentiis was in the Chair.

### Present at Public Session

J. De Laurentiis (Vice-Chair), B. Bradford, S. Carroll, A. Heisey, Q.C., J. Karygiannis, R. Lalonde, J. McKelvie, D. Minnan-Wong, J. Osborne (Commissioners), R. Leary (Chief Executive Officer), G. Downie (Chief Expansion Officer), B. Hasserjian (Chief Safety Officer - Acting), J. La Vita (Interim Chief Financial Officer), B. Leck (General Counsel), K. Llewellyn-Thomas (Chief Customer Officer), M. MacRae (Executive Director – Business Transformation), F. Monaco (Chief of Infrastructure and Engineering), G. Piemontese (Chief People Officer), N. Poole-Moffatt (Chief of Corporate Affairs), S. Reed Tanaka (Chief Capital Officer), J. Ross (Chief Operating Officer), J. Taylor (Chief of Staff), K. Watson (Deputy CEO – Operations), R. Wong (Chief Vehicle Officer), V. Albanese (Head – Diversity & Human Rights), M. Atlas (Associate General Counsel), T. Bal (Head – Audit, Risk and Compliance), D. Brown (Head – Marketing and Customer Experience), A. Cassar (Director – Budgets, Costing and Financial Reporting), I. Dickson (Manager – Design and Wayfinding), S. Haskill (Head – Project Development and Planning), O. Kobylansky (Executive Director, Operations), J. Lawrence (Acting Head – Special Constables), S. Milloy (Director – Employee Relations), M. Mis (Head – Service Planning)

and Schedules), R. Persad (Director – Information Security Office), M. Piemontese (Director – Project Procurement), M. Picard-Cousins (Manager – Customer Experience), D. Shanmuganayagam (Chief Information Officer), K. Thorburn (Head of Strategic Initiatives), C. Finnerty (Manager – CEO Business Support), J. Ishak (Administrator – Secretariat Services), K. Lee (Director – Commission Services) and A. Farnsworth (Co-ordinator – Secretariat Services).

J. De Laurentiis was in the Chair.

### **Appointment of Meeting Chair**

Commissioner Minnan-Wong moved that Joanne De Laurentiis be nominated for meeting Chair.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner Minnan-Wong.

In favour: Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

Absent: Commissioners Heisey, Karygiannis.

The motion by Commissioner Minnan-Wong carried on a unanimous vote of the members present.

### **Land Acknowledgement**

Commissioner De Laurentiis acknowledged that the TTC Board was meeting on the traditional territory of many nations including the Mississaugas of the Credit, the Anishnabeg, the Chippewa, the Haudenosaunee and the Wendat peoples and is now home to many diverse First Nations, Inuit and Métis peoples. Commissioner De Laurentiis also acknowledged that Toronto is covered by Treaty 13 signed with the Mississaugas of the Credit.

### **Declaration of Interest - Municipal Conflict of Interest Act**

Nil

### **Public Presentations**

Item No. 1: Amendments to the Bylaw to Govern TTC Board Meeting Proceedings to Enable Electronic Participation During an Emergency

Alan Yule

The Board received the deputation for information (see Item 1 for minute).

Item No. 5: Preliminary COVID-19 Financial Impacts for the TTC

Mazin Aribi (Advisory Committee on Accessible Transit - ACAT)

Alan Yule

The Board received the deputations for information (see Item 5 for minute).

Item No. 11: Development of the 5-Year Fare Policy and 10-Year Fare Collection Outlook  
Alan Yule

Adam Cohoon

The Board received the deputations for information (see Item 11 for minute).

Item No. 12: TTC Wayfinding Strategy

Alan Yule

Adam Cohoon

The Board received the deputations for information (see Item 12 for minute).

### **Presentations/Reports/Other Business**

1. Amendments to the Bylaw to Govern TTC Board Meeting Proceedings to Enable Electronic Participation During an Emergency

Commissioner Lalonde moved the staff recommendation, as follows:

It is recommended that the TTC Board:

1. Approve the proposed amendments to the Bylaw to Govern TTC Board Meeting Proceedings to provide for electronic participation during an emergency declared to exist in all or part of the City under section 4 or 7.0.1 of the Emergency Management and Civil Protection Act, attached as Appendix 1.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner Lalonde.

In favour: Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, De Laurentiis, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

The motion by Commssioner Lalonde carried on a unanimous vote.

Approved

2. Election of Vice-Chair of the TTC Board.

Commissioner De Laurentiis turned the meeting over to K. Lee to oversee the election process.

Commissioner Heisey moved that Joanne De Laurentiis be nominated Vice-Chair of the TTC Board. Commissioner De Laurentiis gave consent to the nomination.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote for the election of Joanne De Laurentiis as Vice-Chair of the TTC Board.

In favour: Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, De Laurentiis, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

The election of Joanne De Laurentiis as Vice-Chair of the TTC Board carried on a unanimous vote.

Approved

3. Chief Executive Officer's Report – May 2020 Update

Commissioner Carroll moved receipt of the Chief Executive Officer's Report – May 2020 Update for information.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner Carroll.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

Absent: Commissioner Heisey.

The motion by Commissioner Carroll carried on a unanimous vote of the members present.

Received

4. TTC's Response to COVID-19 (Presentation)

A joint staff presentation with a confidential component covering Items 4 and 5 was delivered by Kirsten Watson (Deputy CEO/Operations), Betty Hasserjian (Chief Safety Officer – Acting), Mark Mis (Head – Service Planning & Schedules), Josie La Vita (Interim Chief Financial Officer) and Gemma Piemontese (Chief People Officer).

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote to receive the staff presentation regarding TTC's Response to COVID-19 for information.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

The staff presentation was received on a unanimous vote.

Received

5. Preliminary COVID-19 Financial Impacts for the TTC

Vice-Chair De Laurentiis moved the following motion:

That the Board recess as the Committee of the Whole for completion of the staff presentation and to consider matters related to labour relations or employee negotiations in relation to Item 5 on this agenda.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Vice-Chair De Laurentiis.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

The motion by Vice-Chair De Laurentiis carried on a unanimous vote.

The Board resolved into Committee of the Whole.

The Board returned to open session.

Commissioner Carroll moved the following motion:

That the TTC Board asks the Chair and CEO to jointly communicate in writing to all three orders of government that we call upon them to develop a TTC funding model that reduces our reliance upon our own farebox to support our day-to-day operating expense, making us less vulnerable in the current pandemic crisis and more sustainable overall to support the recovery of the nation's largest local economy.

Commissioner Karygiannis moved the following motion:

That the motion by Commissioner Carroll be amended as follows:

That the TTC Board asks the Chair, **and** CEO **and the Union** to jointly communicate in writing to all three orders of government that we call upon them to develop a TTC funding model that reduces our reliance upon our own farebox to support our day-to-day operating expense, making us less vulnerable in the current Pandemic Crisis and more sustainable overall to support the recovery of the nation's largest local economy.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner Karygiannis.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

Opposed: Commissioner Carroll

The motion by Commissioner Karygiannis to amend Commissioner Carroll's motion carried on a vote of 8 to 1.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner Carroll, as amended.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

The motion by Commissioner Carroll, as amended, carried on a unanimous vote.

Commissioner Osborne moved the following motion:

It is recommended that the TTC Board:

1. Request the CEO of the TTC to continue implementation of the customer communications strategy regarding safety measures on the TTC and emphasize messaging that supports Toronto Public Health advice strongly recommending the wearing of a face covering where physical distancing cannot be maintained.
2. Request the CEO to immediately engage the Province of Ontario, Toronto Public Health, the City's Office of Recovery and Rebuild, and peer transit agencies on the legal, operational, safety and financial implications of mandatory face coverings for customers on public transit, and to take any further measures appropriate to ensure the safety of customers and employees on the system.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner Osborne.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

The motion by Commissioner Osborne carried on a unanimous vote.

Commissioner Carroll moved the following motion:

That Recommendation 5 in the staff report be amended as follows:

“The CEO of the Toronto Transit Commission provide regular updates to the TTC Board on the financial impacts estimates due to changes in assumptions and plans arising from recovery events, **and specifically when the 30% ridership capacity benchmark is met.**”

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner Carroll.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

The motion by Commissioner Carroll carried on a unanimous vote.

The staff recommendations, as amended, were considered as follows:

It is recommended that the TTC Board:

1. Endorse the expenditure of unbudgeted funds required for COVID-19 response activities, as detailed in this report which are currently estimated to be in the order of \$15.4 million until Labour Day.
2. Endorse the TTC's cost containment strategy as outlined in this report, noting that even with the implementation of these measures, operating emergency funding currently estimated at a minimum of \$300 million will be required.
3. Endorse the workforce realignment strategy as outlined in Confidential Attachment 1.
4. Approve a net reduction of \$208.1 million to the TTC's 2020 Approved Capital Budget and a reduction of \$117.5 million to the 2020-2029 Capital Budget & Plan, as outlined in Appendix 2.
5. The CEO of the Toronto Transit Commission provide regular updates to the TTC Board on the financial impacts estimates due to changes in assumptions and plans arising from recovery events, and specifically when the 30% ridership capacity benchmark is met.
6. Authorize that the information contained in the Confidential Attachment remain confidential in its entirety as it relates to labour relations or employee negotiations.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote to adopt the item, as amended.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

The item, as amended, was adopted on a unanimous vote.

Approved

Correspondence submitted by: Alan Yule.

6. State of Good Repair Contract Award (Withdrawn)
7. 2019 TTC Special Constable Service Annual Report to the TTC Board and Toronto Police Services Board

The staff recommendation was considered as follows:

It is recommended that the TTC Board:

1. Approve the transmittal of the attached report to the Toronto Police Services Board in accordance with Section 8.9 of the Special Constable Agreement between the Toronto Police Services Board and the TTC.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote to adopt the staff recommendation.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

The staff recommendation was adopted on a unanimous vote.

Approved

8. TTC 2019 Annual Report – Public Complaints Involving Special Constables and Fare Inspectors

Commissioner Bradford moved the following motion:

That the TTC Board request the TTC Chief Executive Officer to report by the fourth quarter of 2020 with a status update on the proposed Investigation Unit to receive and investigate customer complaints, and applying both the Transit Enforcement Code of Conduct, and the applicable TTC corporate policies.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner Bradford.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Osborne.

Absent: Commissioner Minnan-Wong.

The motion by Commissioner Bradford carried on a unanimous vote of the members present.

Commissioner Carroll moved the following motion:

1. That the annual report must include a breakdown of numbers of items which were internally investigated and those that were externally investigated by complaint type.
  2. That all matters that are flagged for external investigation become numbered cases, reported directly to the board upon being designated as such and that the resolution of each case be reported directly to the board.
- K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner Bradford.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner Carroll.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.



The motion by Commissioner Carroll carried on a unanimous vote.

The staff recommendation was considered as follows:

It is recommended that the TTC Board:

1. Receive this report for information.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote to adopt the item as amended.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

The item, as amended, was adopted on a unanimous vote.

Approved

9. Supply of BAE Parts

Commissioner Bradford moved adoption of the staff recommendation, as follows:

It is recommended that the TTC Board:

1. Authorize issuing contracts for the supply of various BAE parts for a three-year period commencing upon notification of award (May 2020) to two companies in the upset limit amounts as follows, which include applicable taxes:
  - a. City View Bus Sales & Service Ltd. for the supply of 62 parts in the total upset limit amount of \$7,892,000 USD (which is equivalent to \$11,250,000 CDN).
  - b. Prevost, A Division of Volvo Group Canada Inc. for the supply of 12 parts in the total upset limit amount of \$1,283,000 CDN.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner Bradford.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

The motion by Commissioner Bradford was adopted on a unanimous vote.

Approved

10. Financial Update for the Year Ended December 31, 2019 and Major Projects Update

Commissioner Bradford moved receipt of the Financial Update for the Year Ended December 31, 2019 and Major Projects Update.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner Bradford.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, Lalonde, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

The motion by Commissioner Bradford carried on a unanimous vote.

Received

Correspondence submitted by: The Waterfront BIA.

11. Development of the 5-Year Fare Policy and 10-Year Fare Collection Outlook

Commissioner Bradford moved the staff recommendation, as follows:

It is recommended that the TTC Board:

1. Endorse the scope of work for the 5-Year Fare Policy and 10-Year Fare Collection Outlook, with the final proposed strategy to be presented to the Board in Q4 2021.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner Bradford.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

Absent: Commissioner Lalonde.

The motion by Commissioner Bradford was adopted on a unanimous vote of the members present.

Approved

Correspondence submitted by: Alan Yule, Adam Cohoon.

12. TTC Wayfinding Strategy

Commissioner McKelvie moved the staff recommendation, as follows:

It is recommended that the TTC Board:

1. Endorse the TTC Wayfinding Strategy.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner McKelvie.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

Absent: Commissioner Lalonde.

The motion by Commissioner McKelvie was adopted on a unanimous vote of the members present.

Approved

13. TTC Status Update – Information and Cybersecurity Strategy

Commissioner Carroll moved the following motion:

It is recommended that the TTC Board:

1. Defer the item to the next meeting of the TTC Board and give it priority status on that meeting agenda.

K. Lee conducted a recorded vote on the motion by Commissioner Carroll.

In favour: Vice-Chair De Laurentiis, Commissioners Bradford, Carroll, Heisey, Karygiannis, McKelvie, Minnan-Wong, Osborne.

Absent: Commissioner Lalonde.

The motion by Commissioner Carroll carried on a unanimous vote of the members present.

Deferred

The meeting adjourned at 5:42 p.m.