

# TORONTO TRANSIT COMMISSION REPORT NO.

**MEETING DATE:** APRIL 6, 2011

**SUBJECT:** TTC COMMISSIONER EXPENSES 2003 - 2009

## **INFORMATION ITEM**

---

### **RECOMMENDATION**

It is recommended that the Commission receive this report on TTC Commissioner Expenses for the years 2003 to 2009.

### **BACKGROUND**

At its meeting of March 1, 2011, the Commission requested that staff bring a report back to the next meeting with a summary of the remuneration and expenses of the Chair, Vice-Chair and members of the Commission for the years 2003 to 2009.

At various Commission meetings in the past, the Commission directed that the TTC's conference and business travel policy harmonize with that of the City, and in particular, that Commissioner travel requests be approved and expenses reimbursed according to the City of Toronto's guidelines.

In that context, all other expenses that the Chair (or other Commissioners) may incur as a result of TTC business should follow the same principle. Eligibility guidelines can be found in the Councillor Office Expense Budget Manual. Staff are advised that the Councillor Office Expense Policy is currently under review, and any approved changes resulting from that review will likewise be adopted to govern TTC Commissioner expenses.

### **DISCUSSION**

A summary of TTC Commissioner Expenses for the years 2003 to 2009 is set out in Appendix A1 and A2. No remuneration was given to any of the Commissioners during their terms on the Commission or its subsidiaries.

Appendix B sets out guidelines regarding Commissioner Travel, the Chair's Office Budget, approval process, expense guidelines, claims process and disclosure.

**JUSTIFICATION**

The summary of Commissioner expenses for the years 2003 to 2009 is in response to a request from the Commission at its last meeting. The expense protocol provides a framework to govern these expenses.

42-36

March 23, 2011

TTC COMMISSIONER EXPENSES 2003 to 2009  
BUSINESS TRAVEL

<u>YEAR</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>CONFERENCE/EVENT</u>	<u>LOCATION</u>	<u>TOTAL COST</u>
<div style="border: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"> <p>Legend:</p> <p>APTA = American Public Transportation Association            CUTA = Canadian Urban Transit Association            UITP = International Association of Public Transport            UITP MENA = UITP Middle East and North African Region            UITP/UATP = UITP &amp; African Association of Public Transport</p> </div>				
<u>2003</u>	Chair Howard Moscoe	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition May 2 to 9, 2003	Madrid, Spain	\$ 5,538.03
	Commissioner Brian Ashton	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition May 2 to 9, 2003	Madrid, Spain	\$ 5,613.21
	Past Chair Betty Disero	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition - forfeited flight cost due to her resignation from City Council on March 14, 2003	Madrid, Spain	\$ 1,001.41
				<u>\$ 12,152.65</u>
<u>2004</u>	Chair Howard Moscoe	APTA Annual Meeting October 9 to 14, 2004	Atlanta, Georgia	\$ 3,130.78
		CUTA Fall Conference November 6 to 11, 2004	Montreal, Quebec	\$ 2,284.25
	Vice-Chair Joe Mihevc	APTA Annual Meeting October 10 to 13, 2004	Atlanta, Georgia	\$ 2,937.56
		CUTA Fall Conference November 7 to 10, 2004	Montreal, Quebec	\$ 1,739.16
				<u>\$ 10,091.75</u>

TTC COMMISSIONER EXPENSES 2003 to 2009  
BUSINESS TRAVEL

APPENDIX A1  
p 2 of 5

<u>YEAR</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>CONFERENCE/EVENT</u>	<u>LOCATION</u>	<u>TOTAL COST</u>
<u>2005</u>	Chair Howard Moscoe	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition June 5 to 9, 2005	Rome, Italy	\$ 5,081.47
	Vice-Chair Adam Giambrone	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition June 6 to 10, 2005	Rome, Italy	\$ 5,009.26
	Commissioner Brian Ashton	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition June 4 to 11, 2005	Rome, Italy	\$ 5,401.31
	Commissioner Sandra Bussin	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition June 4 to 9, 2005	Rome, Italy	\$ 5,140.89
	Commissioner Joe Mihevc	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition June 4 to 10, 2005	Rome, Italy	\$ 5,631.78
		CUTA Fall Conference November 19 to 23, 2005	Vancouver, B.C.	\$ 2,213.38
	Commissioner Bill Saundercook	APTA Conference September 25 to 27, 2005	Dallas, Texas	\$ 2,104.22
		CUTA Fall Conference November 21 to 25, 2005	Vancouver, B.C.	\$ 2,637.52
	Commissioner Bas Balkissoon	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition June 4 to 11, 2005	Rome, Italy	\$ 5,175.11
	Commissioner David Shiner	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition - forfeited registration fee: did not attend	Rome, Italy	\$ 1,750.50
				<u>\$40,145.44</u>

TTC COMMISSIONER EXPENSES 2003 to 2009  
BUSINESS TRAVEL

APPENDIX A1  
p 3 of 5

<u>YEAR</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>CONFERENCE/EVENT</u>	<u>LOCATION</u>	<u>TOTAL COST</u>
<b><u>2006</u></b>	Chair Howard Moscoe	CUTA Annual Conference May 27 to 31, 2006	Saskatoon, Saskatchewan	\$ 2,148.11
		Meeting with representatives of CUTA and FCM. March 22 to 23, 2006	Ottawa, Ontario	\$ 805.70
	Vice-Chair Adam Giambrone	CUTA Annual Conference May 29 to 31, 2006	Saskatoon, Saskatchewan	\$ 2,242.33
	Commissioner Joe Mihevc	CUTA Annual Conference May 28 to May 31, 2006	Saskatoon, Saskatchewan	\$ 2,285.31
		CUTA Government Relations Day and Executive Committee Meeting April 3 to 4, 2006	Ottawa, Ontario	\$ 810.20
	Commissioner Sandra Bussin	Reimbursement of unrecoverable personal travel expenses as a result of an emergency in-camera Commission meeting held on June 7, 2006 (Management & Labour Issues)		\$ 1,131.52
Commissioner Bill Saundercook	CUTA Annual Conference May 29 to 30, 2006	Saskatoon, Saskatchewan	\$ 1,862.90	
			<u>\$11,286.07</u>	
<b><u>2007</u></b>	Chair Adam Giambrone	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition May 18 to 24, 2007	Helsinki, Finland	\$ 5,586.64
		CUTA Annual Conference June 10 to 11, 2007	Halifax, NS	\$ 2,597.95
	Vice-Chair Joe Mihevc	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition May 18 to 25, 2007	Helsinki, Finland	\$ 6,347.03
		CUTA Annual Conference June 9 to 13, 2007	Halifax, NS	\$ 1,761.34
	Commissioner Anthony Perruzza	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition May 21 to 24, 2007	Helsinki, Finland	\$ 5,655.71
	Commissioner Bill Saundercook	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition May 20 to 27, 2007	Helsinki, Finland	\$ 6,509.28
	Commissioner Michael Thompson	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition May 18 to 26, 2007	Helsinki, Finland	\$ 6,638.74
	Commissioner Peter Milczyn	UITP World Congress and Mobility and City Transport Exhibition May 19 to 26, 2007	Helsinki, Finland	\$ 5,535.13
			<u>\$40,631.82</u>	

TTC COMMISSIONER EXPENSES 2003 to 2009  
 BUSINESS TRAVEL

<u>YEAR</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>CONFERENCE/EVENT</u>	<u>LOCATION</u>	<u>TOTAL COST</u>
<u>2008</u>	Chair Adam Giambrone	APTA Annual Meeting & Meet with Los Angeles Transit Officials October 3 to 8, 2008	San Diego, CA	\$ 3,769.68
		CUTA Fall Conference November 10 to 11, 2008	Windsor, ON	\$ 1,281.83
	Vice-Chair Joe Mihevc	CUTA Fall Conference November 8 to 11, 2008	Windsor, ON	\$ 1,908.37
		Government Relations Meeting	Ottawa, ON	\$ 1,060.42
	Commissioner Bill Saundercook	APTA Rail Conference May 31 to June 4, 2008	San Franciso, CA	\$ 2,744.39
	Commissioner Peter Milczyn	APTA Rail Conference May 31 to June 4, 2008	San Francisco, CA	\$ 2,044.49
	Commissioner Sandra Bussin	APTA Rail Conference May 31 to June 4, 2008	San Franciso, CA	\$ 2,651.78
				<u>\$15,460.96</u>

TTC COMMISSIONER EXPENSES 2003 to 2009  
BUSINESS TRAVEL

APPENDIX A1  
p 5 of 5

<u>YEAR</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>CONFERENCE/EVENT</u>	<u>LOCATION</u>	<u>TOTAL COST</u>
<u>2009</u>	Chair Adam Giambrone	Business Visits/Meetings with South American transit properties (February 9-18, 2009)	Buenos Aires, Bogota, Santiago Curitiba, Sao Paolo	\$ 1,173.90
		Business Visits/Meetings with Asian Transit Properties (March 14-19, 2009)	Tokyo, Shanghai, Beijing, Seoul, Singapore, Hong Kong	\$ 1,803.61
		UITP World Congress, and visits to other European transit properties (June 6-18, 2009)	Vienna, Barcelona and Madrid	\$ 6,808.25
		L.A. Governors' Climate Change Summit (Sept 29 to 30, 2009)	Los Angeles, California	\$ 880.26
		APTA Annual Meeting (October 4-7, 2009)	Orlando, Florida	\$ 1,862.34
		UITP MENA Congress (Oct 22 to Oct 26, 2009)	Qatar	\$ 595.78
		UITP /UATP International Seminar (Nov 8 to 14, 2009)	Nairobi, Kenya	\$ 641.48
		UITP Asia Seminar (Nov 20 to 25, 2009)	Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia	\$ 357.97
	Vice-Chair Joe Mihevc	CUTA Government Relations Meeting (January 29/09)	Ottawa	\$ 358.93
		UITP World Congress (June 6-12, 2009)	Vienna, Austria	\$ 5,799.40
		CUTA Fall Conference (Nov 7-11, 2009)	Montreal	\$ 1,721.44
	Commissioner Maria Augimeri	UITP World Congress (June 6-13, 2009)	Vienna, Austria	\$ 5,343.06
	Commissioner Sandra Bussin	UITP World Congress (June 6-12, 2009)	Vienna, Austria	\$ 6,530.21
	Commissioner Peter Milczyn	UITP World Congress (June 6-11, 2009)	Vienna, Austria	\$ 4,743.15
	Commissioner Ron Moeser	UITP World Congress (June 5-11, 2009)	Vienna, Austria	\$ 5,610.45
	Commissioner Anthony Perruzza	UITP World Congress (June 6-12, 2009)	Vienna, Austria	\$ 5,163.29
	Commissioner Bill Saundercook	UITP World Congress (June 6-13, 2009)	Vienna, Austria	\$ 6,427.12
		CUTA Fall Conference (Nov 7-11, 2009)	Montreal, Quebec	\$ 1,371.25
				<u>\$57,191.89</u>

TTC CHAIR'S OFFICE BUDGET  
2003 to 2009

<u>YEAR</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>TOTAL COST</u>
2003	Chair Howard Moscoe	NIL
2004	Chair Howard Moscoe	NIL
2005	Chair Howard Moscoe	<u>\$ 22,582.09</u>
2006	Chair Howard Moscoe	<u>\$ 45,846.46</u>
2007	Chair Adam Giambrone	\$ 71,178.54
	Past Chair Howard Moscoe	<u>\$ 4,142.06</u>
		<u>\$ 75,320.60</u>
2008	Chair Adam Giambrone	<u>\$ 89,942.60</u>
2009	Chair Adam Giambrone	<u>\$ 89,842.67</u>



**COMMISSIONER EXPENSE PROTOCOL**

Two guiding principles apply to Commissioner expenses: funds must be available in the budget and all expenditures must comply with City of Toronto guidelines. TTC practices for approval, claims, expense eligibility and disclosure follow that of the City and TTC staff consults with the City Clerk's office on matters that require clarification.

**BUDGET**

The TTC Operating Budget includes an allocation for the following:

- \$100,000 for the Chair's Office Budget in 2011 (including staff assistance, communications, office space), or such other amount as approved in future budgets.
- In accordance with the City Councillor Expense Policy, budget overruns will not be permitted, and must be paid out of personal funds.

**APPROVALS**

- for travel requests:
  - for each event over \$7,000 (inclusive of registration), Commission approval is required in advance.
  - for each event under \$7,000 (inclusive of registration), prior approval of the Chair of the Commission is required, together with confirmation from the General Secretary that funds are available within the Commissioner travel budget.
  - no more than two Commissioners shall attend the same conference, unless the conference is in the GTA area.

**EXPENSE GUIDELINES**

- expense eligibility is set out in the City of Toronto Councillor Office Expense Budget Manual.
- for travel:
  - a \$100 per diem is provided to cover the cost of meals, personal phone calls, entertainment and other personal expenses.
  - Expense claims are only permissible for dates encompassing the duration of the event and required travel time.
- Advances:
  - Commissioners may be reimbursed for transportation costs (e.g. airfare), accommodation and registration fees that are paid in advance.
  - Cash advances for hotel and per diem costs may be requested no sooner than two weeks prior to departure.
  - Advances must be settled immediately against the claim for which they are issued.

**COMMISSIONER EXPENSE PROTOCOL**

**CLAIMS**

- Claims will be processed in accordance with City of Toronto eligibility guidelines.
- Claims must be submitted promptly following the date when the expenditure is incurred (i.e. within 4 weeks).
- The claim must include original copies and supporting documentation for each element of the claim.
- Claims must be submitted under the signature of the Commissioner.
- Commissioner expense claims will be approved by the General Secretary, the Chief General Manager and the Chair of the Commission.
- Claims by the Chair will be approved by the General Secretary, the Chief General Manager and the Vice-Chair of the Commission.
- Claims against the Chair's Office Budget will be approved by the Chief Financial Officer and the General Secretary; a summary report of actual charges will be provided quarterly to the Vice-Chair for approval.
- Staff will process eligible and fully approved claims within two weeks of receipt.

**DISCLOSURE**

- Commissioner expenses will be disclosed as follows:
  - All expenses will be reported to the City for inclusion in an annual report to Council entitled "Remuneration and Expenses of Members of Council and of Council Appointees to Agencies, Boards, Commissions, Corporations and Other Special Purpose Bodies".
  - The Chair's Office Budget expenses, including supporting invoices/receipts will be posted quarterly on the TTC's website (ttc.ca).