TORONTO TRANSIT COMMISSION REPORT NO.

MEETING DATE: November 17, 2009

SUBJECT: CORPORATE POLICY REVIEW – EMPLOYEE SUGGESTION PLAN POLICY 4.27.6

ACTION ITEM:

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Commission approve the following TTC Corporate Policy, as amended, which is attached as Appendix 'A':

• Policy 4.27.6 Employee Suggestion Plan

BACKGROUND

At its meeting on July 14, 2004 the Commission approved a motion to undertake a review of the TTC's Corporate Policy Manual.

DISCUSSION

The above process commended at the Commission meeting of February 9, 2005. The Employee Suggestion Plan Policy is hereby submitted for Commission approval with minor changes only (See Appendix 'B').

November 17, 2009 40-31 Attachments: Appendix 'A' Appendix 'B'

POLICY/INSTRUCTION

CLASSIFICATION	DATE APPROVED	P/I NUMBER
Human Resources		4.27.6

1.0 RESPONSIBILITY

Executive Director - Human Resources

2.0 PURPOSE

The Employee Suggestion Plan (ESP) Program is intended to promote and encourage suggestions from employees to achieve improved customer service, passenger safety, productivity, operational efficiency and other benefits to the TTC. The ESP program is a formal procedure for recognizing and/or rewarding and implementing suggestions in accordance with established criteria.

3.0 DEFINITION OF A SUGGESTION

- 3.1 A suggestion is an innovative idea which helps to identify and improve a situation and will result in a benefit and/or saving to the organization. To be eligible under the ESP Program, a suggestion must:
 - identify and provide an effective solution to a problem; or
 - result in cost savings and/or increased revenues; or
 - improve customer safety and/or service; or
 - improve the efficiency and/or productivity of TTC operations through new/revised methods, procedures, systems, equipment, public relations/marketing, communications, etc.
- 3.2 The ESP Program will only accept ideas as suggestions. Employees are prohibited from performing physical work at the work location to develop, fabricate, modify and/or implement any tool, equipment, machinery, system, work process or method, etc., prior to the approval of the suggestion through the ESP Program.

4.0 ELIGIBILITY

4.1 <u>Employee</u>

4.1.1 All active TTC employees (including summer students) are eligible to participate in the ESP Program, with the following exceptions:

APPROVED	REVISION NO.	SUPERSEDES	PAGE
Gary Webster Chief General Manager	5	4.27.5	1 of 7

POLICY/INSTRUCTION

SUBJECT	CLASSIFICATION	DATE APPROVED	P/I NUMBER
Employee Suggestion Plan	Human Resources		4.27.6

- 4.1.1.1 Employees in Salary Levels 13 to 18.
- 4.1.1.2 Employees temporarily assigned to or participating in the development of a company project, where it is the employee's specific responsibility to investigate, develop or implement ideas on a given subject.
- 4.1.1.3 Co-op students.
- 4.1.1.4 Union Executive/Board Members
- 4.1.2 Contract employees who are employed to offer consultant services, and non-employee labour assistance (NELA), are not considered TTC employees and therefore not eligible to participate in the ESP Program.
- 4.1.3 Should an employee's status change (i.e. retired, promoted, resigned, etc.) following the submission of a suggestion, eligibility for any award will be determined based on his or her employee status at the time the suggestion was submitted. Employee's who are off on LTD or WSIB Benefits at the time a monetary award is being granted will receive payment upon return to work.

4.2 <u>Suggestion</u>

To be eligible under the ESP Program, a suggestion must:

- be consistent with the definition set out in Section 3.0;
- be original (not submitted by someone else in the past three years);
- be original to the suggestor;
- identify a specific problem with a proposed solution. An opinion or complaint that does not offer a well-detailed solution will be considered ineligible;
- be directly unrelated to the suggestor's regular or temporary job duties;
- be unrelated to occupational health or safety issues. Such suggestions are encouraged on an ongoing basis and should follow the normal process through the Joint Health and Safety Committee process;

APPROVED	REVISION NO.	SUPERSEDES	PAGE
Gary Webster Chief General Manager	5	4.27.5	2 of 7

POLICY/INSTRUCTION

SUBJECT	CLASSIFICATION	DATE APPROVED	P/I NUMBER
Employee Suggestion Plan	Human Resources		4.27.6

- be unrelated to items covered by the Collective Agreement as these are mutually agreed upon by union and management representatives through the negotiation process (this includes company benefits, work week/hours, etc.). Ideas regarding Commission policies not covered by the Collective Agreement nor covered by existing Commission policies can be submitted;
- be legible and submitted on the appropriate ESP Form, available from the reading racks throughout the TTC or the Human Resources Department. All the required information including associated drawings, detailed descriptions, etc., must be provided and securely attached to the form. The form must be signed and dated by the employee(s) submitting the suggestion;
- be complete and accurate. The proposed suggestion should include enough information, in sufficient detail, so that the idea can be implemented;
- be an idea which does not restore a situation to its proper order, involve routine maintenance and/or general housekeeping matters.
- Note: Operators and transportation supervisors cannot submit a suggestion to the ESP Program which relates to major service delays, route changes or operator/customer inconvenience. Although such suggestions are encouraged, they are to be submitted to the divisional superintendent or staff involved in the local route management programs.

5.0 EVALUATION PROCESS

Completed ESP forms must be forwarded to the Human Resources Department which administers, monitors, and oversees the ESP Program.

- 5.1 Where feasible, the Human Resources Department will conduct a preliminary assessment of suggestor and suggestion eligibility. If the suggestor and/or suggestion do not meet eligibility criteria, written notification will be forwarded to the employee. All eligible suggestions will be recorded and tracked.
- 5.2 The suggestor will receive a written acknowledgement of the suggestion from the Human Resources Department within five working days from the date the suggestion was received, and the suggestor will also be advised that they may

APPROVED	REVISION NO.	SUPERSEDES	PAGE
Gary Webster Chief General Manager	5	4.27.5	3 of 7

POLICY/INSTRUCTION

SUBJECT	CLASSIFICATION	DATE APPROVED	P/I NUMBER
Employee Suggestion Plan	Human Resources		4.27.6

be consulted during the evaluation process.

- 5.3 The suggestion is then forwarded to the appropriate department which has the expertise to review and evaluate the suggestion. The evaluating department has 30 working days to evaluate a suggestion and forward an ESP Investigation Report to the Human Resources Department. If the evaluating department requires additional time to assess the suggestion, the Human Resources Department must be advised in writing. The Human Resources Department will provide the employee with a progress report which outlines the revised date.
- 5.4 All completed ESP Investigation Reports are forwarded to the Human Resources Department who will confirm the evaluation assessment and award eligibility, if appropriate, prior to the suggestor being informed of the evaluation outcome. If consensus is not reached, issues of dispute will be brought to an Employee Suggestion Plan Committee, consisting of Human Resources Department personnel and representatives from the evaluating department, for final resolution.
- 5.5 The suggestor will receive written notification of the final evaluation result and a copy of the evaluating department's ESP Investigation Report recommending the suggestion be either awarded or not accepted, and the associated reasons.
- 5.6 Where the award is contested, the suggestor must direct this in writing to the attention of the Human Resources Department within 60 days of award payment. A valid reason must accompany the disputed award, stipulating specific oversights in the investigation.
- 5.7 Where a suggestion is not accepted and the suggestor has further information to support it, a request for re-evaluation may be submitted within 60 days from the time the employee was notified that the suggestion was not accepted. Such requests may be submitted on a new ESP Form with an explanation of why the original suggestion merits further consideration. Additional supporting information must be provided. Onus is on the employee to justify re-evaluation of the suggestion. Suggestors can not re-submit their suggestions for re-evaluation more than once.
- 5.8 All suggestions submitted, including those not accepted, remain valid for a period of three years. A re-evaluation request does not extend the three year active life of the original suggestion. Original suggestions cannot be altered for re-evaluation. New solutions must be submitted as new suggestions. If the

APPROVED	REVISION NO.	SUPERSEDES	PAGE
Gary Webster Chief General Manager	5	4.27.5	4 of 7

POLICY/INSTRUCTION

SUBJECT	CLASSIFICATION	DATE APPROVED	P/I NUMBER
Employee Suggestion Plan	Human Resources		4.27.6

three year period has expired and the suggestor would like to keep the suggestion active, they must re-submit the suggestion on a new ESP form and reference the prior ESP number.

6.0 AWARD STRUCTURE

6.1 Awards are based on the nature of the suggestion's benefits. The award structure is categorized to compensate for benefits which are deemed to be tangible, intangible, or in some way deserving merit.

6.1.1 <u>Tangible Awards</u>

The benefits of a suggestion are tangible when the suggestion is accepted and the suggestion results in proven net savings. The award amount is calculated as 10% of the first year's net savings to a maximum of \$25,000. The minimum award is \$150.

6.1.2 Intangible Awards

The benefits of a suggestion are intangible when the suggestion is accepted and the suggestion results in improvements which cannot be judged in monetary terms. In this instance, the award is calculated using the Intangible Award Rating Sheet. Intangible award amounts range between \$150 and \$1,000.

6.1.3 Merit Awards

A merit award is given when a suggestion may or may not be accepted, however, the review of the suggestion stimulated important action which in some way benefitted the TTC. An award of \$150 will be given.

6.2 Completed ESP Investigation Reports recommending an award must have the appropriate management approvals based on the award amount (i.e. in addition to the evaluator and department head approval, awards up to \$5,000 require Deputy General Manager approval and awards over \$5,000 require General Manager and Chief General Manager approval). The value of the award will be charged to the department/area which will realize the savings. The ESP Investigation Report must include the cost centre and account number to which the award should be charged.

APPROVED	REVISION NO.	SUPERSEDES	PAGE
Gary Webster Chief General Manager	5	4.27.5	5 of 7

POLICY/INSTRUCTION

SUBJECT	CLASSIFICATION	DATE APPROVED	P/I NUMBER
Employee Suggestion Plan	Human Resources		4.27.6

6.3 Where a suggestion received an award amount of \$500 or more in the previous year, the suggestor(s) will be inducted into the Employee Suggestion Plan Hall of Fame at an annual ceremony.

7.0 METHOD OF PAYMENT

- 7.1 Awards are paid in full through direct deposit. A certificate is presented to the employee by the respective department head (or designate) acknowledging the suggestion.
- 7.2 If two or more employees jointly submit a suggestion, the award is split equally.
- 7.3 If a suggestion combines tangible and intangible benefits, the final award will reflect the actual cost savings and intangible benefits.
- 7.4 All awards are taxable and will be subject to all statutory deductions (i.e. Income Tax, Employment Insurance, Canada Pension Plan, etc.).
- 7.5 Where it has not been possible to accurately assess the value of a suggestion, a moratorium period of up to two years may be declared during which the suggestion is fully evaluated. A nominal award is presented initially and the final award (less the nominal award already presented) is granted at the conclusion of the moratorium period.

8.0 OWNERSHIP

- 8.1 By submitting a suggestion, an employee waives any rights to compensation for the suggestion other than that granted under the Employee Suggestion Plan Program.
- 8.2 A suggestion and all ideas associated with that suggestion become the absolute and exclusive property of the TTC. Any suggestion which has been approved will be implemented by the TTC.
- 8.3 Decisions with respect to the eligibility of suggestions or award amounts granted are the responsibility of the TTC and its decisions are final.

9.0 REFERENCE SOURCES

-	Conditions of Employment Corporate Policy
---	---

APPROVED	REVISION NO.	SUPERSEDES	PAGE
Gary Webster Chief General Manager	5	4.27.5	6 of 7

POLICY/INSTRUCTION

SUBJECT	CLASSIFICATION	DATE APPROVED	P/I NUMBER
Employee Suggestion Plan	Human Resources		4.27.6

- Employee Suggestion Plan Form (Form No. 803142)
- Employee Suggestion Plan Guide
- Employee Suggestion Plan Investigation Report
- Evaluator's Handbook
- Intangible Award Rating Sheet (Form No. 4941)

APPROVED	REVISION NO.	SUPERSEDES	PAGE
Gary Webster Chief General Manager	5	4.27.5	7 of 7

POLICY/INSTRUCTION

CLASSIFICATION	DATE APPROVED	P/I NUMBER
Human Resources		4.27.6

1.0 RESPONSIBILITY

Executive Director - Human Resources

2.0 PURPOSE

The Employee Suggestion Plan (ESP) Program is intended to promote and encourage suggestions from employees to achieve improved customer service, passenger safety, productivity, operational efficiency and other benefits to the TTC. The ESP program is a formal procedure for recognizing and/or rewarding and implementing suggestions in accordance with established criteria.

3.0 DEFINITION OF A SUGGESTION

- 3.1 A suggestion is an innovative idea which helps to identify and improve a situation and will result in a benefit and/or saving to the organization. To be eligible under the ESP Program, a suggestion must:
 - identify and provide an effective solution to a problem; or
 - result in cost savings and/or increased revenues; or
 - improve customer safety and/or service; or
 - improve the efficiency and/or productivity of TTC operations through new/revised methods, procedures, systems, equipment, public relations/marketing, communications, etc.
- 3.2 The ESP Program will only accept ideas as suggestions. Employees are prohibited from performing physical work at the work location to develop, fabricate, modify and/or implement any tool, equipment, machinery, system, work process or method, etc., prior to the approval of the suggestion through the ESP Program.

4.0 ELIGIBILITY

4.1 <u>Employee</u>

4.1.1 All active TTC employees (including summer students) are eligible to participate in the ESP Program, with the following exceptions:

APPROVED	REVISION NO.	SUPERSEDES	PAGE
Gary Webster Chief General Manager	5	4.27.5	1 of 7

POLICY/INSTRUCTION

SUBJECT	CLASSIFICATION	DATE APPROVED	P/I NUMBER
Employee Suggestion Plan	Human Resources		4.27.6

- 4.1.1.1 Employees in Salary Levels 13 to 18.
- 4.1.1.2 Employees temporarily assigned to or participating in the development of a company project, where it is the employee's specific responsibility to investigate, develop or implement ideas on a given subject.
- 4.1.1.3 Co-op students.
- 4.1.1.4 Union Executive/Board Members
- 4.1.2 Contract employees who are employed to offer consultant services, and non-employee labour assistance (NELA), are not considered TTC employees and therefore not eligible to participate in the ESP Program.
- 4.1.3 Should an employee's status change (i.e. retired, promoted, resigned, etc.) following the submission of a suggestion, eligibility for any award will be determined based on his or her employee status at the time the suggestion was submitted. Employee's who are off on LTD or WSIB Benefits at the time a monetary award is being granted will receive payment upon return to work.

4.2 <u>Suggestion</u>

To be eligible under the ESP Program, a suggestion must:

- be consistent with the definition set out in Section 3.0;
- be original (not submitted by someone else in the past three years);
- be original to the suggestor;
- identify a specific problem with a proposed solution. An opinion or complaint that does not offer a well-detailed solution will be considered ineligible;
- be directly unrelated to the suggestor's regular or temporary job duties;
- be unrelated to occupational health or safety issues. Such suggestions are encouraged on an ongoing basis and should follow the normal process through the Joint Health and Safety Committee process;

APPROVED	REVISION NO.	SUPERSEDES	PAGE
Gary Webster Chief General Manager	5	4.27.5	2 of 7

POLICY/INSTRUCTION

SUBJECT	CLASSIFICATION	DATE APPROVED	P/I NUMBER
Employee Suggestion Plan	Human Resources		4.27.6

- be unrelated to items covered by the Collective Agreement as these are mutually agreed upon by union and management representatives through the negotiation process (this includes company benefits, work week/hours, etc.). Ideas regarding Commission policies not covered by the Collective Agreement nor covered by existing Commission policies can be submitted;
- be legible and submitted on the appropriate ESP Form, available from the reading racks throughout the TTC or the Human Resources Department. All the required information including associated drawings, detailed descriptions, etc., must be provided and securely attached to the form. The form must be signed and dated by the employee(s) submitting the suggestion;
- be complete and accurate. The proposed suggestion should include enough information, in sufficient detail, so that the idea can be implemented;
- be an idea which does not restore a situation to its proper order, involve routine maintenance and/or general housekeeping matters.
- Note: Operators and transportation supervisors cannot submit a suggestion to the ESP Program which relates to major service delays, route changes or operator/customer inconvenience. Although such suggestions are encouraged, they are to be submitted to the divisional superintendent or staff involved in the local route management programs.

5.0 EVALUATION PROCESS

Completed ESP forms must be forwarded to the Human Resources Department which administers, monitors, and oversees the ESP Program.

- 5.1 Where feasible, the Human Resources Department will conduct a preliminary assessment of suggestor and suggestion eligibility. If the suggestor and/or suggestion do not meet eligibility criteria, written notification will be forwarded to the employee. All eligible suggestions will be recorded and tracked.
- 5.2 The suggestor will receive a written acknowledgement of the suggestion from the Human Resources Department within five working days from the date the suggestion was received, and the suggestor will also be advised that they may

APPROVED	REVISION NO.	SUPERSEDES	PAGE
Gary Webster Chief General Manager	5	4.27.5	3 of 7

POLICY/INSTRUCTION

SUBJECT	CLASSIFICATION	DATE APPROVED	P/I NUMBER
Employee Suggestion Plan	Human Resources		4.27.6

be consulted during the evaluation process.

- 5.3 The suggestion is then forwarded to the appropriate department which has the expertise to review and evaluate the suggestion. The evaluating department has 30 working days to evaluate a suggestion and forward an ESP Investigation Report to the Human Resources Department. If the evaluating department requires additional time to assess the suggestion, the Human Resources Department must be advised in writing. The Human Resources Department will provide the employee with a progress report which outlines the revised date.
- 5.4 All completed ESP Investigation Reports are forwarded to the Human Resources Department who will confirm the evaluation assessment and award eligibility, if appropriate, prior to the suggestor being informed of the evaluation outcome. If consensus is not reached, issues of dispute will be brought to an Employee Suggestion Plan Committee, consisting of Human Resources Department personnel and representatives from the evaluating department, for final resolution.
- 5.5 The suggestor will receive written notification of the final evaluation result and a copy of the evaluating department's ESP Investigation Report recommending the suggestion be either awarded or not accepted, and the associated reasons.
- 5.6 Where the award is contested, the suggestor must direct this in writing to the attention of the Human Resources Department within 60 days of award payment. A valid reason must accompany the disputed award, stipulating specific oversights in the investigation.
- 5.7 Where a suggestion is not accepted and the suggestor has further information to support it, a request for re-evaluation may be submitted within 60 days from the time the employee was notified that the suggestion was not accepted. Such requests may be submitted on a new ESP Form with an explanation of why the original suggestion merits further consideration. Additional supporting information must be provided. Onus is on the employee to justify re-evaluation of the suggestion. Suggestors can not re-submit their suggestions for re-evaluation more than once.
- 5.8 All suggestions submitted, including those not accepted, remain valid for a period of three years. A re-evaluation request does not extend the three year active life of the original suggestion. Original suggestions cannot be altered for re-evaluation. New solutions must be submitted as new suggestions. If the

APPROVED	REVISION NO.	SUPERSEDES	PAGE
Gary Webster Chief General Manager	5	4.27.5	4 of 7

POLICY/INSTRUCTION

SUBJECT	CLASSIFICATION	DATE APPROVED	P/I NUMBER
Employee Suggestion Plan	Human Resources		4.27.6

three year period has expired and the suggestor would like to keep the suggestion active, they must re-submit the suggestion on a new ESP form and reference the prior ESP number.

6.0 AWARD STRUCTURE

6.1 Awards are based on the nature of the suggestion's benefits. The award structure is categorized to compensate for benefits which are deemed to be tangible, intangible, or in some way deserving merit.

6.1.1 Tangible Awards

The benefits of a suggestion are tangible when the suggestion is accepted and the suggestion results in proven net savings. The award amount is calculated as 10% of the first year's net savings to a maximum of \$25,000. The minimum award is \$150.

6.1.2 Intangible Awards

The benefits of a suggestion are intangible when the suggestion is accepted and the suggestion results in improvements which cannot be judged in monetary terms. In this instance, the award is calculated using the Intangible Award Rating Sheet. Intangible award amounts range between \$150 and \$1,000.

6.1.3 Merit Awards

A merit award is given when a suggestion may or may not be accepted, however, the review of the suggestion stimulated important action which in some way benefitted the TTC. An award of \$150 will be given.

6.2 Completed ESP Investigation Reports recommending an award must have the appropriate management approvals based on the award amount (i.e. in addition to the evaluator and department head approval, awards up to \$5,000 require Deputy General Manager approval and awards over \$5,000 require General Manager and Chief General Manager approval). The value of the award will be charged to the department/area which will realize the savings. The ESP Investigation Report must include the cost centre and account number to which the award should be charged.

APPROVED	REVISION NO.	SUPERSEDES	PAGE
Gary Webster Chief General Manager	5	4.27.5	5 of 7

POLICY/INSTRUCTION

SUBJECT	CLASSIFICATION	DATE APPROVED	P/I NUMBER
Employee Suggestion Plan	Human Resources		4.27.6

6.3 Where a suggestion received an award amount of \$500 or more in the previous year, the suggestor(s) will be inducted into the Employee Suggestion Plan Hall of Fame at an annual ceremony.

7.0 METHOD OF PAYMENT

- 7.1 Awards are paid in full through direct deposit. A certificate is presented to the employee by the respective department head (or designate) acknowledging the suggestion.
- 7.2 If two or more employees jointly submit a suggestion, the award is split equally.
- 7.3 If a suggestion combines tangible and intangible benefits, the final award will reflect the actual cost savings and intangible benefits.
- 7.4 All awards are taxable and will be subject to all statutory deductions (i.e. Income Tax, Employment Insurance, Canada Pension Plan, etc.).
- 7.5 Where it has not been possible to accurately assess the value of a suggestion, a moratorium period of up to two years may be declared during which the suggestion is fully evaluated. A nominal award is presented initially and the final award (less the nominal award already presented) is granted at the conclusion of the moratorium period.

8.0 OWNERSHIP

- 8.1 By submitting a suggestion, an employee waives any rights to compensation for the suggestion other than that granted under the Employee Suggestion Plan Program.
- 8.2 A suggestion and all ideas associated with that suggestion become the absolute and exclusive property of the TTC. Any suggestion which has been approved will be implemented by the TTC.
- 8.3 Decisions with respect to the eligibility of suggestions or award amounts granted are the responsibility of the TTC and its decisions are final.

9.0 REFERENCE SOURCES

-	Conditions of Employment Corporate Policy
---	---

APPROVED	REVISION NO.	SUPERSEDES	PAGE
Gary Webster Chief General Manager	5	4.27.5	6 of 7

POLICY/INSTRUCTION

SUBJECT	CLASSIFICATION	DATE APPROVED	P/I NUMBER
Employee Suggestion Plan	Human Resources		4.27.6

- Employee Suggestion Plan Form (Form No. 803142)
- Employee Suggestion Plan Guide
- Employee Suggestion Plan Investigation Report
- Evaluator's Handbook
- Intangible Award Rating Sheet (Form No. 4941)

APPROVED	REVISION NO.	SUPERSEDES	PAGE
Gary Webster Chief General Manager	5	4.27.5	7 of 7