

TORONTO TRANSIT COMMISSION REPORT NO.

MEETING DATE: October 23, 2008

SUBJECT: PROCUREMENT AUTHORIZATION
SUBWAY STATION DESIGN SERVICES
TORONTO-YORK SPADINA SUBWAY EXTENSION PROJECT
CONTRACT A85-75

ACTION ITEM

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Commission authorize the award of contracts to the following firms, in the upset limit amounts listed below, for Subway Station Design Services, Toronto-York Spadina Subway Extension Project, Contract A85-75, for a total upset limit amount of \$70,000,000:

1. The Spadina Group Associates (Team A)	\$15,000,000	Steeles West
2. The Spadina Group Associates (Team B)	\$12,000,000	Finch West
3. Arup Canada Inc. (Team A)	\$12,000,000	Vaughan Corporate Centre
4. Earth Tech Canada Inc. (Team A)	\$12,000,000	Highway 407
5. Arup Canada Inc. (Team B)	\$11,000,000	York University
6. Earth Tech Canada Inc. (Team B)	\$8,000,000	Sheppard West

FUNDING

Sufficient funds for this expenditure are included in the Toronto-York Spadina Subway Extension Project, as set out on pages 1479 to 1482 of the TTC 2009-2013 Capital Program (Category - Expansion) which was approved by the Commission on August 27, 2008.

BACKGROUND

The TTC is planning the design and construction of an underground subway line from the existing Downsview Station on the Spadina Line located in the City of Toronto, to the proposed Vaughan Corporate Centre located in the City of Vaughan, Region of York. The new 8.6 km long line will include both tunnelled and cut and cover sections.

**PROCUREMENT AUTHORIZATION
SUBWAY STATION DESIGN SERVICES
TORONTO-YORK SPADINA SUBWAY EXTENSION PROJECT
CONTRACT A85-75**

There will be a total of six new passenger stations on the Toronto-York Spadina Subway Extension, namely:

- Sheppard West
- Finch West
- York University
- Steeles West
- Highway 407
- Vaughan Corporate Centre (VCC)

The Toronto-York Spadina Subway Extension (TYSSE) project is being funded by the Federal Government, Province of Ontario, the Regional Municipality of York and the City of Toronto. The TTC will directly manage the TYSSE project and will own and operate the subway extension.

York Region will manage the design and construction of some surface facilities, specifically, passenger pick-up and drop-offs and regional bus terminals located within York Region. The TTC will manage the design and construction of all other components of the project.

To facilitate design, the TYSSE Project's fixed facilities have been divided into a number of engineering/architectural design work packages to be undertaken by external engineering and architectural consultants. The contracts recommended for award cover the six station design work packages. The Request for Proposal (RFP) also included a statement that any station may proceed to a design build option.

DISCUSSION

A RFP was publicly advertised in the Globe & Mail, World Architectural News and on the Commission's Web site as of July 31, 2008. Forty-nine companies requested copies of the proposal documents, out of which fourteen proposals were submitted. Six proposals contained a separate Team 'B' for a second station.

It was pre-determined that proponents may be awarded up to two station designs provided they submitted two separate teams which were to be evaluated separately.

The recommendation for award is based on the highest rated qualified proponents with reasonable pricing. It was also pre-determined that the highest rated proponent would receive the highest valued station design with the balance of the awards based on next highest rankings. In the event that any proponents were rated equal, award of contracts would be determined by the Commission at its sole discretion.

**PROCUREMENT AUTHORIZATION
SUBWAY STATION DESIGN SERVICES
TORONTO-YORK SPADINA SUBWAY EXTENSION PROJECT
CONTRACT A85-75**

All proposals received were reviewed and rated by the evaluation team. The evaluation team was composed of six individuals including representatives from the TTC, the City of Toronto and the Region of York. This team collectively evaluated the proposals based on the evaluation criteria listed in Appendix A.

Following the determination of the final ranking, the pricing envelopes of the six highest rated proponents were opened and evaluated.

The proposals submitted by The Spadina Group Associates, Arup Canada Inc. and Earth Tech Canada Inc. were considered superior as their teams demonstrated the best overall experience and presented the best detailed and innovative methodology.

One of the objectives of the RFP document was to encourage the submission of project teams which include local and international Architects with proven innovative approaches and world class experience. This objective appears to have been achieved and is reflected in the teams chosen for award as indicated in Appendix A.

Upon review of the confidential pricing information from the three companies, the rates appear reasonable, although higher than for routine design as expected to account for the level of expertise and international experience proposed.

The Contracts will be administered on a Work Plan Release basis, which permits the Commission to stop work at any time during the contract.

JUSTIFICATION

The award of these contracts will enable the completion of design services for the six new passenger stations on the TYSSE Project.

October 8, 2008
70-2-JW
1131577
Attachment: Appendix A

APPENDIX A

SUBWAY STATION DESIGN SERVICES TORONTO-YORK SPADINA SUBWAY EXTENSION PROJECT CONTRACT A85-75

LIST OF PROPONENTS (in alphabetical order)

Arup Canada Inc.* (Team A) – Grimshaw Architects (U.K.) Adamson Associates (Local)
Arup Canada Inc.* (Team B) – Foster & Partners (U.K.) Adamson Associates (Local)
Buro Happold Consulting
Earth Tech Canada Inc.* (Team A) – Aedas (U.K.) DMJM Harris/Aecom (USA)
Earth Tech Canada Inc.* (Team B) – Aedas (U.K.) DMJM Harris/Aecom (USA)
Genivar Inc.
Giffels Associates Limited/IBI Group (Team A & B)
HOK Architects Corporation (Team A & B)
MJP Architects Ltd.
Strasman Architects Inc.
The Spadina Group Associates* (Team A) – Alsop Architects (U.K.) Stevens Group (Local)
The Spadina Group Associates* (Team B) – Stevens Group (Local) Alsop Architects (U.K.)
Trow Associates Inc.
URS Canada Inc. (Team A & B)
Weston Williamson Ltd.
Yolles Partnership Inc.

*Recommended Companies (Lead Architect listed first followed by Design Architect)

PROPOSAL EVALUATION CRITERIA

- A. CORPORATE QUALIFICATIONS/EXPERIENCE
- Number of Years in Business
 - Depth of Available Relevant Resources at Proponent's Local Office
 - Relevant Corporate Experience by Project
- B. PROJECT STAFF QUALIFICATIONS/EXPERIENCE
- a) Project Manager
- Number of Years of Direct Experience
 - Relevant Project Experience
 - Technical Qualifications
- b) Project Team Members
- Number of Years of Direct Experience
 - Relevant Project Experience
 - Technical Qualifications
- C. METHODOLOGY
- Proposed Methodology/Understanding/Approach to the Work