

While every effort is made to ensure the accuracy of the contents of this site, users should be aware that due to circumstances beyond our control, it may be necessary to change the text of documents posted here and therefore no responsibility will be accepted by the Toronto Transit Commission for discrepancies which may occur between documents contained on this site and the formal hardcopy versions presented to the Commission.

**If it is necessary to rely on the accuracy of Commission documents the Office of the General Secretary should be contacted at 393-3698 to obtain a certified copy. ONLY **HARDCOPY RECORDS CERTIFIED BY THE GENERAL SECRETARY WILL BE DEEMED TO BE OFFICIAL.****

Form Revised: February 2005

---

**TORONTO TRANSIT COMMISSION  
REPORT NO.**

**MEETING DATE: December 16, 2005**

**SUBJECT: Procurement Authorization – Supply Of Two (2) Garbage Packer Trucks**

**RECOMMENDATION**

It is recommended that the Commission authorize the award of a contract to Joe Johnson Equipment in the amount of \$334,304.30 for the supply of two (2) rear loading garbage packer trucks complete with cart tipper mechanisms.

**FUNDING**

Sufficient funds for these expenditures were included in Project 4.21 Purchase Automotive Non-Revenue Vehicles, under Purchase Replacement Non-Revenue Vehicles (as set out on pages 1071 to 1090 of the State of Good Repair / Safety Category) in the TTC 2006-2010 Capital Program, as approved by the Commission on November 28, 2005.

**BACKGROUND**

The Commission currently owns a total of six (6) garbage packer trucks. Two (2) garbage packer trucks are larger side loading trucks. Four (4) garbage packer trucks are smaller rear loading trucks complete with cart tipper mechanisms. One (1) of the four (4) rear loading trucks is retained as a spare and used to supplement the fleet in case of a front line vehicle breakdown. The vehicles are used for collecting garbage throughout the Commission's properties and stations.

Prior to 2001, Subway Operations ran special trains for picking up garbage. In December 2000, a fire occurred in the Old Mill Station on a special train and it was decided at that time to discontinue the use of the trains and use the Commission's fleet of garbage packer trucks. Since that time, the trucks have been heavily used resulting in a requirement to replace two (2) trucks due to their deteriorated condition and high

mileage.

## **DISCUSSION**

The Request for Proposals (RFP) was for the supply of two (2) conventional 25 cubic yard rear-loading garbage packer trucks complete with a fully containerized system for the specific duty of refuse collection from TTC refuse containers and standard garbage bag pickup. The work includes the design, assembly, integration and delivery of diesel powered truck chassis' and garbage packer bodies to form two (2) complete garbage packer trucks. The RFP also requested that proponents may provide optional pricing for chassis maintenance manuals and additional copies of packer body operation manuals.

In preparing this RFP, staff reviewed the City's specifications for similar garbage packer trucks to determine whether a joint purchase could be pursued. It was determined that the Commission's garbage packer trucks are used in areas, such as stations with overhanging canopies, where the vehicle's height is a critical requirement. The City's specifications for garbage packer trucks do not state a maximum vehicle height requirement that would be consistent with the Commission's requirement. It was determined that there was no apparent benefit to pursuing the possible joint purchase further.

Specifications were prepared and a RFP was issued to seventeen (17) companies on September 15, 2005, with a closing date of November 1, 2005. Proposals were received from four (4) companies which are summarized on the attached Appendix "A". The proposal validity date expires on March 1, 2006.

Metro International Toronto Inc. (Metro) submitted the lowest priced proposal which stated numerous technical exceptions to the specified requirements with the key items as follows: one (1) piece front bumper offered in lieu of three (3) piece collapsible; did not offer cross-over mirrors to provide view of rear of vehicle; cannot meet the specified minimum cab head room and knee space requirements; did not offer adjustable seating; and did not offer the provision of emergency stop buttons.

Fanotech Enviro Inc. (Fanotech) submitted the second lowest priced proposal which stated numerous technical exceptions with the key items as follows: did not offer the specified requirements for vinyl upholstery, a body hoist, rear shocks, emergency stop buttons and a specified list of pertinent Ontario Ministry of Labour guidelines and standards relevant to the garbage packer vehicle offered.

Discussions with Vehicle Engineering staff have resulted in the determination that on the basis of the exceptions stated above, the submissions from Metro and Fanotech are considered unacceptable.

Joe Johnson Equipment (Joe Johnson) submitted the third lowest priced proposal and did not state any exceptions to the specified requirements of the RFP. Their submission also offered optional pricing for the provision of chassis maintenance manuals, the cost of which is included in the recommended award amount. Therefore, on the basis of the foregoing, the Joe Johnson proposal is considered acceptable. Joe Johnson have satisfactorily completed similar work for the Commission in the past.

Donway Ford Sales Ltd. (Donway) submitted the highest priced proposal which stated a commercial exception to the proposal validity period by offering 60 days (to December 31, 2005) in lieu of 120 days as specified, the determination of commercial acceptability of which has not been reviewed as the submission is not being recommended. Their submission also stated technical exceptions to the specified requirements for rear shocks and a separate spin off fuel filter. In view of the foregoing, the submission from Donway is considered unacceptable.

## **JUSTIFICATION**

Two (2) existing Commission rear loading garbage packer trucks have reached the end of their useful lives and require replacement. The Commission's garbage packer trucks are replaced based on a combination of vehicle condition, 200,000 km of mileage, eight (8) years of age, and maintenance costs. These criteria are compliant with the Metro Fleet Efficiency Study as approved by the Council of Metropolitan Toronto on March 3, 1993. The vehicles being replaced are in deteriorated condition and have mileage in the 200,000 km and 300,000 km ranges.

-----

December 14, 2005

5-95

Attachment: Appendix "A"

**APPENDIX "A"**

**PROPOSALS RECEIVED**

COMPANY	TOTAL AMOUNT*	COMMENT
METRO INTERNATIONAL TORONTO INC.	\$ 329,613.75	
FANOTECH ENVIRO INC.	\$ 330,198.90	
JOE JOHNSON EQUIPMENT	\$ 334,304.30	RECOMMENDED
DONWAY FORD SALES	\$ 342,829.10	

**\*(Includes provision of CD-ROM Manuals.)**