



Audit, Risk and Compliance – Audit Plan Status Update

Date: June 5, 2024
To: Audit and Risk Management Committee
From: Head of Audit, Risk and Compliance

Summary

The Audit, Risk and Compliance Department (ARC) 2024 Audit Plan was presented and approved by the Audit and Risk Management Committee (ARMC) on November 14, 2023. The list of audit assurance projects identified for completion in 2024 are performed in addition to advisory or special requests subsequently put forward for ARC's consideration.

As of Q2 2024, ARC has completed five projects initiated in 2023 as identified in the 2023 Audit Plan, originally approved by the Audit and Risk Management Committee on February 13, 2023 and subsequently updated and approved on June 1, 2023.

This report provides information with respect to ARC's progress on 2023 and 2024 Audit Plan items as well as details regarding three specific assurance reviews in response to the ARMC's March 19, 2024 request.

Recommendations

It is recommended that the Audit and Risk Management Committee:

1. Receive this report for information.

Financial Summary

The implementation of the 2024 Audit Plan has no funding implications beyond the costs of the ARC Department that were included in the 2024 Operating Budget approved by the TTC Board on December 20, 2023, and by the City Council on February 14, 2024.

The Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial summary information.

Equity/Accessibility Matters

The independent assurance and advisory work of the ARC Department supports TTC leadership efforts to continuously improve controls and integrate risk management into processes that drive the achievement of corporate goals and objectives, including accessibility, diversity and inclusion.

Decision History

At its meeting on February 13, 2023, the Audit and Risk Management Committee approved the Audit, Risk and Compliance 2023 Audit Plan.

[Audit, Risk and Compliance \(ARC\) – 2023 Audit Plan](#)

The 2023 Audit Plan was subsequently updated by staff and approved by the Audit and Risk Management Committee on June 1, 2023.

[Audit, Risk and Compliance – Work Plan Status Update](#)

The 2024 Audit Plan was presented and approved by the Audit and Risk Management Committee on November 14, 2023.

[Audit, Risk and Compliance \(ARC\) – 2024 Audit Plan](#)

The Audit and Risk Management Committee on March 19, 2024 made a request that the Completed Assurance Review Results for Transit Operators – Hiring, Onboarding and Retention, Transit Control, and Transit Security be referred to staff for more fulsome reports.

[Audit, Risk and Compliance - Audit Plan Status Update - TTC ARMC Decision](#)

Issue Background

The Audit and Risk Management Committee assists the TTC Board in fulfilling its oversight responsibilities in several areas including: audits, a system of internal control, compliance with laws and regulations, and enterprise risk management activities.

While it is the responsibility of TTC business areas to formulate policies and enforce compliance with plans and strategies, ARC can support those directly accountable for ensuring such plans achieve their stated objectives by providing management with independent assurance or function in an advisory capacity.

Comments

Planned assurance projects are performed in accordance with ARC's annual Work Plan as approved by the Audit and Risk Management Committee. Each project is completed in three phases – Planning, Fieldwork and Reporting. Once management responses and corrective action plans to address ARC recommendations have been prepared, the full report is formally issued to the TTC Chief Executive Officer, Deputy Chief Executive Officer and all applicable internal stakeholders, and the project is considered to have been completed.

Status Update – 2023 Planned Audit Projects

ARC staff has issued a final report summarizing key observations, recommendations and agreed-upon management action plans for five projects initiated in 2023. These include a review of:

- Subway Car Maintenance Program;
- Operator Hiring, Onboarding and Retention processes;
- Transit Control Centre incoming call response processes;
- Transit Security Special Constable Service incident response processes; and
- Fare Evasion Study.

Status Update – 2024 Planned Audit Projects

#	Project Name	Status
1	Actuarial Reserves	Fieldwork
2	IT General Controls	Planning
3	Elevator Maintenance	Planning
4	Station Passenger Intercoms	Planning
5	Hiring, Onboarding and Retention of Non-Operators	Not Yet Started
6	Capital Expenditures – Projects (Portfolio)	Not Yet Started

ARC has also initiated fieldwork for one 2024 audit project (review of TTC Actuarial Reserves) and planning for three other 2024 audit projects (review of IT General Controls, Station Passenger Intercoms and Elevator Maintenance).

Finally, ARC continues to support and respond to special requests from TTC Executives and Senior Management, while balancing ARC staff capacity and value to the organization. Results are shared with applicable management, and ARC facilitates necessary discussions among all key stakeholders to support appropriate actions in response to critical observations and insights.

Completed Assurance Reviews Results – ARC High-Level Commentary

In response to the ARMC’s March 19, 2024 request to refer the Completed Assurance Review Results for Transit Operators – Hiring, Onboarding and Retention, Transit Control, and Transit Security to staff for more fulsome reports, background details and summaries of high- and medium-rated observations and recommendations for these three completed assurance reviews have been provided in Attachment 1. Extracts from ARC’s issued reports for these three assurance reviews provide further detail in Attachment 2. Finally, for each Assurance Review, ARC offers the following supplementary comments:

ARC Review (issued January 2024) – Operator Hiring, Onboarding and Retention

Rationale for Audit: TTC Leadership has identified Recruitment and Retention of critical human resources as a top enterprise risk. Talent Management made concentrated efforts to streamline hiring/onboarding processes to address the need to recruit a high

volume of Operators in 2021 and 2022, i.e. 450 and 1,100 respectively. Also, outreach and recruitment efforts were made to increase the hiring of women and visible minorities in line with the TTC's Diversity and Inclusion Action Plan.

Overall Key ARC Observations/Recommendations: The results of ARC's review indicated that improvement is needed, mainly in the reporting of achieved hiring, onboarding and retention goals, and the related processes of data collection, record keeping and data analysis, which need to be more fulsome to ensure data is fully substantiated, reconciled and clearly explained in various issued reports.

For example, hiring targets should be reported in conjunction with Operator metrics on employment discontinuation and termination rates. Information, such as Operations Training Centre's voluntary Operator training discontinuation rates, Transportation's statistics on Operator resignations within defined periods, and the number of targeted group hires that successfully pass probationary periods should be considered.

By presenting a complete picture and balanced perspective, management will be better able to fairly assess whether long term performance objectives are being met; whether Operators hired via the new streamlined process are proving to meet the Transportation and Vehicle Group's operational headcount needs; that new Operators are performing reasonably well within TTC's unionized seniority rules environment; and whether programs designed to support retention of women and diverse groups are effective. Recruitment metrics including time to fill Operator positions, cost per hire and Transportation and Vehicle Group's satisfaction also need to be established to provide meaningful context and detail.

ARC also highlighted a need to review and improve processes to ensure that the most suitable candidates are hired as employees. Since recruiting, hiring and onboarding of Operators collectively impacts employee on-the-job performance and retention, greater collaboration amongst numerous groups (i.e. Talent Management, Human Resources, Operations Training Centre and Transportation) is required to collect and analyze all relevant data/performance trends in a manner that informs management and supports complete monitoring of the Operator position life cycle.

Management Action Plans: ARC understands that various groups are working together to address ARC's recommendations and that efforts continue to refine data and to standardize data collection and governance processes to enable more in-depth performance monitoring of Operator related recruitment, hiring, onboarding and retention activities that span across multiple groups within the TTC.

ARC Review (issued February 2024) –Transit Control Dispatching

Rationale for Audit: In fall 2022, Transit Control Operations was restructured to be under the responsibility of the Chief Operations and Infrastructure Officer (COIO). A change in leadership is an opportune time to conduct an audit and inform new management of areas where attention may be required. While initiatives were already underway per the COIO's instructions at the time of our audit, there was agreement to proceed so ARC recommendations could be incorporated into existing plans to review procedures and dispatcher training, etc. Given the complexity of Transit Control operations, ARC

focused on assessing roles, responsibilities and related processes across eight types of Dispatcher Desks.

Overall Key ARC Observations/Recommendations: ARC observed that management has implemented numerous initiatives to improve Transit Control operations, including: overhauling departmental Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs); reporting responses to daily incoming calls; formalizing a Dispatcher training program and materials; and reinstating departmental performance audit expectations.

However, ARC noted there is still an opportunity for further improvements to be made concerning the: collection and prioritization of incident information; communication between Transit Control's Security Desk and TTC Special Constables assigned to support the Security Desk; monitoring and reporting of incoming calls and incident response times; updating of departmental procedures; and completion of Dispatcher performance audits.

Management Action Plans: ARC understands that Transit Control management is establishing a working group to engage and solicit information from other transit agencies on incident management, and that clarity around the role and utilization of Special Constables and/or individuals with law enforcement experience within the Transit Control Centre, in particular will be reviewed as part of a broader Third-Party Security Assessment Review. Other initiatives include: pursuing a three-phased approach to achieving a balanced, demand-based Dispatcher shift schedule; establishing a new data analysis dashboard for monitoring response to incoming calls/report; and revising performance audit criteria and completion frequency expectations following SOP overhaul completion.

ARC Review (issued March 2024) –Transit Security Special Constable Service Incident Response

Rationale for Audit: Given the rise in security-related incidents noted in 2022, Transit Security was considered an area of high importance due to its impact on customer safety/satisfaction and employee safety. And so a review of Transit Security was included in the 2023 Audit Work Plan, with a focus on the Special Constable Service Department (SCS) and the efficiency and effectiveness of its incident response processes.

Overall Key ARC Observations/Recommendations: The SCS performs its services in accordance with the authorities outlined in its Agreement with the Toronto Police Services Board (TPSB). Processes are in place to train and deploy TTC Transit Special Constables (TSCs), and respond to and supervise calls for service to incidents. However, ARC's review indicated improvement is needed in certain areas, including departmental annual planning and achievement reporting processes, data and reporting systems, and performance measurement to enhance the effectiveness of SCS's incident response processes.

Specifically, in addition to its Culture Change Plan, the SCS needs to formalize and articulate a comprehensive and consolidated annual plan to improve communication and reporting of the achievement of desired transit security outcomes. Typical transit

security outcomes may include: enhancing customer satisfaction; preventing and reducing crime and victimization; enhancing safety and order in the system; engaging with reliable multidisciplinary partners; using force sparingly; and using public funds efficiently and fairly. The TTC's go-forward Security Operating model should align with the new TTC Corporate Plan (2024-2028) and provide stability for longer-term security incident response processes to be developed and built upon, as required. If the use of third-party security guards to perform foot patrols or other services is to continue, then more formal performance monitoring controls and contract administration processes need to be established and followed.

Management has taken measures to reduce the attrition rate in the TSC position and these efforts should continue. Efforts should include identifying and eliminating controllable root causes to minimize the lost investment in recruit training and onboarding, and to support effective deployment.

Concerning the data and reporting systems, there is an opportunity to improve the accuracy, completeness and consistency of 'calls for service' data in the Special Constables Service Revenue Protection System (SCSRP). Further, SCSRP does not provide full functionality, such as real-time information capture, GPS tracking or integration with other systems; and so it is susceptible to data input errors and inconsistencies with details documented in Special Constable memo books. The ability to conduct in-depth analysis as to the nature and severity of events is also limited because details are entered via text fields. Finally, to support both internal security events reporting and the City's Dashboard Reporting, ARC recommends that a corporate-wide safety and security event guideline for classifying security system events be developed to ensure accurate, consistent and complete reporting of security events.

Finally, the monitoring of performance metrics for SCS services should be enhanced. For example, SCS should continue its efforts to develop and monitor adherence to performance indicators that measure the timeliness and effectiveness of its response processes. Without monitoring metrics, SCS may lose opportunities to improve customer service relating to call response.

Management Action Plans: In Q4 2023, TTC management appointed an Executive Director to support and drive initiatives within the Revenue Protection, Special Constable Service and other teams. A commitment has been made to complete by Q1 2025 a longer-term security assessment of all TTC community safety and security operations, security assets and resources, and a best practice review of other jurisdictions. Also, a 2025 Annual Plan will be prepared in parallel with the 2025 budgeting process to outline goals, objectives, risks, actions, targets and performance measures for desired service outcomes.

Contact

Viraj Chandrakanthan, Head – Audit, Risk and Compliance
416-393-2030
viraj.chandrakanthan@ttc.ca

Signature

Viraj Chandrakanthan
Head – Audit, Risk and Compliance

Attachments

Attachment 1 – ARC – Completed Assurance Review Results
Attachment 2 – Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

ARC – Completed Assurance Review Results

Transit Operators - Hiring, Onboarding and Retention (January 2024)

Overall Owner: Chief Diversity and Culture Officer

Background:

The TTC's Talent Management Department leads recruitment and hiring across the organization. Talent Management manages the recruitment of Transit Operators through the Transit Operator Program and is responsible for providing consultation and support to the Transportation and Vehicles Group on their hiring objectives.

Recruitment, hiring and onboarding of new Transit Operators involves various groups and departments, and occurs over multiple steps. Once Talent Management determines that an applicant is a good candidate for the Operator position, the individual is offered conditional employment and may begin training, provided by the Operations Training Centre (OTC) to become a Transit Operator. Only individuals who pass OTC's Transit Operator training are offered full-time employment and placed in one of the divisions in the Transportation and Vehicles Group.

Scope:

Assessment included a review of the structure, governance and procedures, and key processes in recruiting, hiring, onboarding and retention of Transit Operators.

Summary of Results: Improvement Required.

High/Medium rated observations/recommendations are summarized as:

1. (H): The review process over reporting of hiring targets needs to be enhanced to ensure information is accurate and clearly presented. For example, when reporting key metrics, senior management should establish and use a consistent basis of measurement and rigorously review reported information to ensure that data, metrics and explanations are clearly and accurately presented, and reconciled among the different reports.
2. (H): Key performance metrics on hiring and related outcomes need to be clearly defined to ensure consistent understanding across the organization. Management should establish benchmarks and measure actuals against them, report all relevant metrics together when assessing strategic objectives, and increase the collection and analysis of relevant recruitment/retention data to better understand issues/trends and to make more informed decisions.
3. (H): Cross-functional groups need to collaborate more effectively to achieve organizational objectives. Specifically, Talent Management, Transportation and Vehicles and OTC should apply lessons learned from earlier mass hiring efforts and analysis of new Operator retention challenges to develop and execute more effective recruiting, hiring and onboarding strategies that ultimately achieve target retention goals.
4. (H): Record-keeping practices and controls for maintaining applicant information during the hiring process need to be strengthened. Consideration should be given to the use of software tracking solutions, standardization of the format of data entry fields, and establishing a central repository in accordance with best practices for the maintenance of candidate documentation. Managerial review of processes followed and records prepared should also be enhanced.

ARC – Completed Assurance Review Results

5. (M): Costs and impact of hiring strategies should be understood and analyzed. For example: costs associated with paying for various pre-employment checks (i.e. aptitude tests, medical tests) and third-party recruiter costs; employee turnover costs (i.e. costs for training ‘no-shows’ and course incompleteness); and performance-related costs (i.e. pre-mature resignation, poor attendance and driving infraction statistics).
6. (M): Efforts to ensure prospective candidates have a realistic understanding of the challenges of the Operator position need to be made to achieve longer-term employee retention and performance goals (i.e. to increase the likelihood that candidates will succeed in the role and remain in the position). Applicants that fully comprehend all aspects of the Operator role (i.e. unionized environment, seniority rules, split shifts, night/week-end/holiday schedules) before they apply or accept a permanent position can reduce hiring/on-boarding costs and performance issues.
7. (M): Hiring processes need to be continuously reviewed within the broader context of achieving corporate employee retention, diversity and performance goals. Transportation user group satisfaction and analysis of the complete Operator position life cycle experienced by incumbents hired via more recent methods should be critically assessed to ensure Operator core competencies are being met and training resources are being effectively utilized. Lessons learned should be applied as part of continuous control improvement efforts.
8. (M): Employee retention strategies and achievement of related hiring goals should be reviewed, and root causes of noted challenges and trends addressed. This might involve exploring the possibility of Collective Bargaining Agreement amendments aimed to attract and retain operators, as well as new financial/non-financial incentives and reward/recognition programs. Also, formal processes for soliciting candid information from those who voluntarily leave the TTC should be established.
9. (M): Hiring procedures should be regularly reviewed, updated and consistently applied. Processes in need of improvement include monitoring and oversight of procedures as well as review of third-party recruiter work and invoices.

Number of Observations and Ratings:

High	Medium	Low
4	5	3

ARC – Completed Assurance Review Results

Transit Control (February 2024)

Overall Owner: Chief Operations and Infrastructure Officer

Background:

The Transit Control Centre (TCC) is responsible for subway and surface route management, co-ordination of response to all emergency and service disruptions, and communication thereof to all internal and external stakeholders. Audit, Risk and Compliance (ARC) reviewed TCC's incoming call response processes for the period of July 31, 2023 to December 13, 2023. As of August 8, 2023, the TCC was operating with 48 Dispatchers across eight types of Dispatch Desks. Dispatchers are responsible for receiving all incoming emergency and non-emergency calls/reports, dispatching appropriate internal responders to reported incidents and/or liaising with external incident responders.

Scope:

The objectives of this review were to gain an understanding of how the TCC responds to incoming calls (including phone calls, alarm activations, radio calls and SafeTTC App messages), and to assess whether effective and efficient controls exist to mitigate risks to an acceptable level. Areas of review included capacity planning, performance measurement, quality assurance checks, training and access to systems.

Summary of Results: Improvement Needed.

High/Medium rated observations/recommendations are summarized as:

1. (H): Incoming call information collection and verification processes need to be enhanced to ensure sufficient details are gathered to support a Dispatcher's ability to accurately assess the scope and urgency of a situation, and to communicate effectively with incident responders and/or external agencies. For example: scenarios covered by current Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) and the Dispatcher Training Guide should be logically structured so Dispatchers quickly solicit critical information regarding the situation and extenuating circumstances upfront as well as use language that will prompt appropriate third-party emergency response; and Supervisors conducting quality performance checks should review a Dispatcher's questioning of a caller for compliance and effectiveness to these guidelines.
2. (H): Detailed guidance on safety/security incident classification needs to be established. Consideration should be given to aligning Transit Control's prioritization and response approach with that of TTC Special Constable Service and the wider TTC to improve communication between Security Desk Dispatchers and Special Constables. Policies and procedures governing the role of any Special Constable or individual with law enforcement experience designated to support Transit Control's Security Desk should be formalized to ensure maximized and consistent utilization.
3. (H): Transit Control's service level standards and expected response times for each type of incoming call/report need to be clarified and monitored so response time analytics can provide insights and support effective resource management. For example: root causes for unanswered emergency calls should be identified, deeper analysis of VISION call events and response times to surface Operator alarms should be performed, and a more granular analysis of actual response time to incoming *SafeTTC App* reports should be conducted to distinguish between time to open versus time to reply. Such analyses could lead to more effective and/or efficient response strategies.

ARC – Completed Assurance Review Results

4. (H): Dispatcher performance measures need to be established and consistently monitored to ensure Transit Control Management can effectively balance operational demands, while supporting Dispatchers' well-being. Consideration should be given to working with appropriate staff to validate the accuracy and completeness of the existing reports (i.e. Daily Call Time Statistics Report and the Dispatcher Availability Report), and to break down statistics by phone number, type of dispatch desk, and individual Dispatcher to enhance performance monitoring. Available reporting on the response to incoming *SafeTTC App* reports should also be better understood and leveraged.
5. (M): Efforts to overhaul Transit Control Standard Operation Procedures (SOPs) should continue, while following a documented quality assurance check process to ensure revised SOPs are accurate and actionable. Attention should be given to streamlining SOP content to avoid duplication and inconsistencies as well as improve the accessibility of SOPs to Transit Control staff.
6. (M): Scenario-based training and exercises should be incorporated into the departmental Dispatcher Training Program to allow Dispatchers to practice problem-solving in a non-stressful environment, and relevant external training materials as applicable/available should be leveraged. Consideration may also be given to inviting guest speakers to training sessions to share their perspectives and experience with dealing with Dispatchers or emergency/security incidents.
7. (M): Controls to ensure departmental performance audits are completed consistently in accordance with expectations of Transit Control Management need to be implemented. Specifically: audits completed as required by each Duty Manager and Assistant Manager should be tracked and monitored for any inconsistencies in execution; responsibility for following up on any noted observations with applicable individuals and providing individuals corrective and timely coaching should be clarified; and all audit results should be analyzed collectively to ensure overall performance themes are identified and addressed through additional training and/or SOP adjustments.

Number of Observations and Ratings:

High	Medium	Low
4	3	3

ARC – Completed Assurance Review Results

Transit Security (March 2024)

Overall Owners: Chief Strategy and Customer Experience Officer and Executive Director – Fare Technology and System Stewardship

Background:

The Special Constable Service (SCS) Department plays an important role in ensuring the safety and security of customers and employees. One of the main functions of SCS is responding to transit security incidents. Audit, Risk and Compliance (ARC) reviewed SCS's incident response processes. SCS staff is required to deliver their services in compliance with the TTC's Special Constable Agreement with the Toronto Police Services Board (TPSB). The agreement confers authorities to SCS to support the enforcement of TTC By-law No.1 and select Federal and Provincial statutes to increase the level of effectiveness and efficiency in delivering security and law enforcement services in the transit system.

Scope:

Assessment included a review of the structure, governance and procedures, and key processes (i.e. incident identification and data capture, response and closure, prevention and program monitoring) used by SCS to respond to calls for service. This review was performed during the period of September 19, 2023 and December 13, 2023.

Summary of Results: Improvement Required.

High/Medium rated observations are summarized as:

1. (H): A comprehensive and consolidated annual departmental plan with clear goals and objectives aligned with the TTC's corporate goals needs to be developed to support the achievement and reporting thereof of desired transit security outcomes. Transit security outcomes may include: enhancing customer safety/satisfaction; preventing and reducing crime and victimization; enhancing safety and order in the system; engaging with reliable multidisciplinary partners; using force sparingly; and using public funds efficiently and fairly. While SCS includes certain performance metrics in various documents, and recently presented a Culture Change Plan that identifies four pillars on how services will be delivered, annual objective setting and preparation of a consolidated departmental plan will help define what outcomes should be achieved and map them to corresponding risks to achieving these objectives, mitigation strategies for managing these risks and measures to track performance to desired outcomes.
2. (H): Efforts to reduce the attrition rate of the Transit Special Constable (TSC) position have been made and should continue to ensure effective deployment of TSCs to respond to incidents, to protect the investment made in TSC recruitment and training, and to provide high-visibility presence. Consideration should be given to documenting and analyzing reasons for high TSC turnover via conducting comprehensive exit interviews, addressing root causes of controllable attrition, and implementing mitigation strategies deemed reasonable and practical in consultation with the TTC's Talent Management and People Group. Possible strategies that should be evaluated include TSC over-hiring, establishing a minimum period of service stipulations, and creating secondment or other career development opportunities that may encourage TSCs to stay.

ARC – Completed Assurance Review Results

3. (M): Enhanced data input and supervisory controls will improve the accuracy, completeness, and consistency of calls for service data in the Special Constable Service and Revenue Protection System. Technology needs should also be assessed to ensure SCS can meet heightened expectations for safety and security event reporting.
4. (M): A documented, corporate-wide safety and security event guideline for classifying security system events, including offence and non-offence events, should be developed in order to effectively support the City’s Community Safety Dashboard reporting. Specifically, to provide meaningful and accurate community safety statistics, the TTC needs to ensure a common understanding and definition of reportable security events across the organization, and determine the data needed to accurately classify and report events in a manner that facilitates trending analyses.
5. (M): SCS’s progress to regularly report response times needs to continue and include establishing baseline service level standards. Procedural expectations and responsibilities of TSCs who remain on scene when TPS is already present and actively resolving an incident and/or when internal stakeholders, such as Station Supervisors, are on the scene should also be clarified. Relevant elements of call response standards include time to accept a call, to arrive at the incident scene and to clear the call. As a minimum, regular tracking of actual response times should then be performed to inform staffing and deployment decisions, as well as to identify opportunities for service improvement.
6. (M): Monitoring of performance metrics for SCS services needs to be enhanced. Specifically, leading/lagging metrics, such as ‘time to respond to and close incidents’, ‘time lost on incidents “cleared on route”’, ‘time spent on High Visibility and Peak Patrols’ and ‘number of incidents not attended by SCS’ should be established. Similarly, criteria and processes for evaluating the effectiveness of incident de-escalation, and the effectiveness of temporary third-party contract services need to be defined.
7. (M): Responsibility for redirecting TSC teams on route to calls that are cleared prior to their arrival has been assigned to Patrol Supervisors, and reasons for calls being “cleared on route” include ‘TSC distance from the incident’, ‘perpetrator left the scene’, ‘another team attended’, and ‘TPS is on the scene’. To improve deployment and dispatching practices, consideration should be given to identifying and analyzing controllable factors that contribute to lost time due to “calls cleared on route”.

Number of Observations and Ratings:

High	Medium	Low
2	5	3

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

REPORT: Transit Operators – Hiring, Onboarding and Retention Review (Issued – January 2024)

Observation #1 – Hiring Targets (H)

Observations and Implications

- Some inconsistencies in reported information across different reports on hiring target achievements were noted.
- The use of a consistent basis of measurement and rigorous review of reported information is needed to ensure that data, metrics and explanations are clearly and accurately presented, and reconciled among various reports.

Recommendations

- Enhance the review process over reporting of hiring target achievements to ensure data, metrics and explanations are clearly and accurately presented.
- Establish and use a consistent basis of measurement when reporting key metrics.

Management Actions

- Talent Management will continue to refine data and will ensure that there is clarity in future presentations.
- Target Completion: Q4 2024.

Observation #2 – Key Performance Hiring Metrics (H)

Observations and Implications

- Hiring targets are not reported in conjunction with Operator metrics on employment discontinuation and termination rates.
- It is difficult to fully assess whether new streamlined hiring processes meet operation headcount needs and if new Operators are performing successfully in hired positions.
- Some metrics exist, however, additional ones could be considered to provide additional insights.

Recommendations

- Co-ordinate efforts across departments to report consolidated results regarding achievement of organizational objectives and analysis of outcomes. Report all relevant metrics together to provide meaningful insights when assessing strategic objectives.
- Consider implementing industry best practices on key performance metrics.
- Establish benchmarks and measure actuals against benchmarks.
- Increase collection and analysis of relevant recruitment/retention data to better understand issues, trends, and achievement of long-term objectives, and to make more informed decisions.

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

Management Actions

- Talent Management and People Group will work together to:
 - Establish standardized data collection and governance processes;
 - Provide a more holistic view of hiring and retention of Operators; and
 - Account for how processes span multiple groups across the organization.
- Target Completion: Q4 2024.

Observation #3 – Cross Functional Collaboration (H)

Observations and Implications

- Cross-functional groups need to more effectively communicate and/or collaborate to develop and implement strategies to achieve organizational objectives.
- Identification of lessons learned from earlier mass hiring efforts and analysis of new Operator retention challenges is required to drive the development and execution of more effective recruiting, hiring and onboarding strategies that ultimately achieve target retention goals.

Recommendations

- Talent Management, Transportation and Vehicles and Operations Training Centre should collaborate more effectively to develop and execute recruiting, hiring and onboarding strategies that ultimately meet longer-term operational performance needs.

Management Actions

- All departments will increase efforts for more consultation and regular sharing of information.
- Target Completion: Q4 2024.

Observation #4 – Record-Keeping Practices (H)

Observations and Implications

- Controls that ensure the completeness and accuracy of maintenance of records used to manage the hiring process need to be further developed and followed.

Recommendations

- Consider a software solution to improve controls and increase efficiency on tracking how candidates progress through the hiring process.
- Review and update data fields being captured (i.e. Rehire-Y/N, individual preferences). Standardize the format of data entry fields and template.
- Periodically review data for accuracy and completeness. Implement controls to follow up on outstanding items on a timely basis.
- Establish and ensure that protocols for record keeping are in place for maintaining candidate information.

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

Management Actions

- Talent Management targeted to complete the backlog of filing by December 2023 and improve the supervisory review process to ensure data is accurate and complete.
- Talent Management worked with ITS Centre of Excellence to develop processes to use Success Factors instead of spreadsheets to manage the candidate pool.
- Target Completion: Q4 2024.

Observation #5 – Cost Analysis (M)

Observations and Implications

- The cost and impact of applied hiring strategies and decisions made are not fully analyzed.
- Lack of analysis of Operator hiring costs may result in an insufficient understanding of direct and indirect financial costs to the organization associated with high training discontinuation rates and early resignations.

Recommendations

- Analyze costs to understand and inform the impact of hiring strategies.
- Consider performing regular analysis of the financial implications of recruiting and hiring strategies to better understand outcomes and to assist in developing future strategies.
- Consult with other departments as deemed necessary to obtain data or analytical support.

Management Actions

- As part of efforts to reassess and change hiring strategies, management will explore how to capture the total cost of hiring at different stages of the process and how to analyze the costs based on consultation with relevant departments.
- Target Completion: Q4 2024.

Observation #6 – Candidate Expectations (M)

Observations and Implications

- Efforts to ensure prospective Operator candidates have a good understanding of the impact on lifestyle and challenges of working as a Transit Operator prior to accepting the position.
- When new employees are not fully aware of the requirements or challenges of the position, long-term employee retention and employee satisfaction is at jeopardy, and adverse performance issues may arise. Investment and resources expended to recruit and train individuals that voluntarily resign after short periods of time contributes to candidate frustration, operational inefficiencies and poor performance that requires management attention.

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

Recommendations

- Ensure that prospective candidates have a realistic understanding of the unique challenges of the position by clearly explaining expectations to candidates.

Management Actions

- Management reviewed the video for the applicant information session, re-assessing the job shadowing criteria, and established a process to solicit feedback from new hires on how to improve the candidate and new employee experience.
- Target Completion: Q4 2024.

Observation #7 – Hiring Process (M)

Observations and Implications

- Hiring process changes have been made since 2021 to streamline and manage the significant recruiting demands over recent years.
- There has been an increasing trend in the proportion of new hires that do not pass the mandatory Operator training or who voluntarily leave the position either during training or within short periods of time following permanent assignment.
- The focus on meeting both high Operator volume hiring within short periods of time may have contributed to some training inefficiencies and undesirable performance issues.

Recommendations

- Continue to review and improve hiring processes that aim to select candidates that will succeed in the role, and ensure that operational position requirements are met.
- Continue to implement procedures that mitigate the risk and cost of “no shows” to new Operator training to ensure the efficient use of training resources.

Management Actions

- Talent Management is reviewing and strengthening the hiring process to select the best candidates and enhance the candidate onboarding experience.
- Target Completion: Q4 2024.

Observation #8 – Employee Retention (M)

Observations and Implications

- Long-term retention of Operators is not being analyzed comprehensively.
- There are inherent challenges with attracting and retaining talent in the transit sector.
- Analysis of employee departures needs to be expanded to inform and facilitate decisions aimed to improve Operator recruitment and retention strategies.

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

Recommendations

- Measure Operator retention and review Operator retention strategies; identify and address noted root causes of any unacceptable trends.
- Explore ways to reward and engage Operators in non-financial ways to improve retention (i.e. through additional driver reward and recognition schemes, other incentives).
- Improve the method for assigning new hires to their preferred locations to increase employee satisfaction and retention.
- Implement standard employee exit procedures that include formal exit interviews for all voluntary departures.

Management Actions

- Several corporate-level items are being considered: employee engagement and recognition programs, process for conducting exit surveys and interviews, and development of appropriate People metrics.
- Within Transportation and Vehicles, existing supports will be enhanced for new employees and employee progress. Also, concerns identified during the probationary and transition periods will be more closely monitored to improve employee experience and engagement.
- Target Completion: Q4 2024.

Observation #9 – Hiring Procedures (M)

Observations and Implications

- It was noted that some hiring procedures were inconsistently applied or were not clearly specified for recruiters to follow.
- The level of documentation maintained for each candidate file varied or was not all available because record-keeping was not up to date.

Recommendations

- Management should review and update recruitment and hiring procedures to provide additional clarity as to expectations of performance.
- Management should ensure that all recruiters, including third parties, follow consistent practices by performing additional oversight and providing additional guidance, as deemed necessary.
- External vendor invoice verification processes should be strengthened to validate payments.

Management Actions

- Talent Management is reviewing the entire hiring process. Supervisory review will also be enhanced to ensure application of standard processes.
- Target Completion: Q4 2024.

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

REPORT: Transit Control Review (Issued – February 2024)

Observation #1 – Information Collection and Relay (H)

Observations and Implications

- Initial questions asked of callers by Dispatchers need to be enhanced and standardized to ensure accurate assessment of the situation and urgency by the Dispatchers.
- Incident information needs to be relayed to external emergency responders using language and definitions that prompt appropriate response and provides third parties with relevant contextual details.

Recommendations

- Review and enhance Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs)/training material on soliciting critical initial information from the caller.
- Assess the Dispatcher's initial information collection as part of the departmental performance audit.
- Gain an understanding of how external responders (i.e. 911) classifies/prioritizes requests for assistance.

Management Actions

- Pursue continuous SOP and Dispatch training improvements.
- Establish a working group to:
 - Explore other North American transit agencies' incident management strategies; and
 - Engage the IT Services and Innovation and Sustainability Departments and explore information management and communication tools.
- Update SOP delivered as a result of the SOP Project.
- Target Completion: Q2 2025.

Observation #2 – Dispatch to Safety/Security Incidents (H)

Observations and Implications

- Detailed guidance on incident classification and prioritization need to be established to assist the Dispatchers with assessing, prioritizing and triaging concurrent incidents.
- Policies and procedures governing the role of any Transit Special Constable (TSC) or individual with law enforcement experience serving within Transit Control need to be formalized to clarify responsibilities and ensure consistent performance.
- Criteria and protocols to facilitate the dispatching of non-Transit Control staff at short notice to assist surface Operators experiencing on-road safety/security incidents need to be established.

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

Recommendations

- Develop guidelines that help Dispatchers identify and prioritize safety/security incidents in consultation with Special Constable Service and/or subject matter experts.
- Enhance real-time communications between the Security Desk and the in-field TSCs to improve the monitoring and triaging of safety/security incidents.
- Review responsibilities and utilization of the TSCs or any law enforcement specialist on duty at Transit Control.
- Explore the feasibility of building a pool of internal “backup” emergency response personnel that could provide on-road assistance to surface Operators at short notice. Consideration should be given to identifying required triggers, criteria and protocols for such support.

Management Actions

- Establish a working committee to engage SCS and TTC transportation/station business units to clarify TCC’s responsibility and authorizations to dispatch TTC resources, address gaps and find opportunities for enhanced response.
- Target Completion: Q1 2024 (revised to Q4 2024).

Observation #3 – Incoming Call Response Time (H)

Observations and Implications

- Transit Control’s service level standards for each type of incoming call/report to which Dispatchers respond need to be clarified so management’s expectations are clear.
- Expected response times aligned with finalized service level standards must also be defined and monitored to ensure response time analytics provide meaningful insights and support effective resource management.

Recommendations

- Clarify service level standards by reviewing existing standards or establishing new standards.
- Develop analysis and regular reporting tools to monitor response time, particularly for unanswered Emergency Calls.
- Enhance existing analysis on response to alarms initiated by surface Operators.
- Assess whether the number of Dispatchers and workstations should be increased or the expected impact (improvement) on call response time.

Management Actions

- Management will adopt a three-phased approach to:
 - Complete process improvements and develop tools for measuring Dispatcher performance and flagging root causes behind unanswered calls, in consultation with Communications Engineering.
 - Complete a service-level standard review, which reflects industry best practices, in consultation with other transit agencies.

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

- Complete a demand-driven analysis to identify opportunities for hiring additional Dispatchers; develop a shift-based schedule that balances workforce resource with daily demand trends; and submit request for further resources, if required.
- Target Completion: Q1 2025.

Observation #4 – Performance Measures (H)

Observations and Implications

- The accuracy and relevance of Dispatcher performance measures need to be enhanced to monitor individual performance and drive management actions.
- Adherence to these measures must be monitored consistently to ensure fair and equitable assessments.

Recommendations

- Expand reportable criteria in the current daily performance measure reports.
- Work with Communications Engineering to validate the accuracy and completeness of the data utilized in current reporting.
- Assess if performance measures could be redesigned to facilitate the monitoring of individual performance.
- Improve utilization of available third-party vendor data (i.e. SafeTTC App reports).
- Assess the cost/benefit of: a) improving the capability of Transit Control's Integrated Communication System through further customization; b) obtaining a departmental resource dedicated to performing data analysis and issue follow-up.

Management Actions

- Introduce new data analysis dashboard to inform strategies and actions relating to defining service level requirements, resource deployment and monitoring individual Dispatcher performance.
- In the absence of a dedicated data analyst within either Transit Control or Communications Engineering to drive necessary data improvements, efforts will be made to better understand and potentially utilize readily available reports.
- Engage the IT Services and Innovation and Sustainability Departments to explore potential data management enhancements; and conduct cost/benefit analysis of new technology, as required.
- Target Completion: Q4 2024.

Observation #5 – Departmental Standard Operating Procedures (M)

Observations and Implications

- Efforts to overhaul TCC's Standard Operation Procedures (SOPs) need to continue and be performed in accordance with a documented quality assurance process.
- Noted inconsistencies and duplication of content need to be addressed to ensure revised SOPs are accurate, streamlined and actionable.

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

Recommendations

- Review the content of each SOP to ensure it is current and consistent with any related SOPs.
- Review each SOP with the intent to remove duplicated content and to consolidate information.
- Ensure each SOP is finalized and approved.
- Improve the accessibility of SOPs to TCC staff by ensuring they may be searched by role.

Management Actions

- New SOP Coordinator onboarded to develop a plan for enhancing document hierarchy and the processes for reviewing/updating Transit Control's internal documents.
- New departmental SharePoint site developed; to be populated with all TCC SOPs, and to allow filtering by role.
- Deliver an enhanced document system that maps to business processes implemented and incorporates details into new employee training.
- Target Completion: Q1 2025.

Observation #6 – Dispatcher Training (M)

Observations and Implications

- Scenario-based training needs to be incorporated into the departmental Dispatcher Training Program.
- Relevant internal/external training materials need to be leveraged where available.
- Having a comprehensive training program will aid in the onboarding of new Dispatchers and the development of a high-performance team.

Recommendations

- Incorporate scenario-based training into the Dispatcher Training Program to encourage learners to consider different potential responses/solutions to a given situation, practice problem-solving and ask questions in a non-stressful environment.
- Invite guest speakers from internal or external stakeholders to share their expertise and experience in interacting with the Dispatchers.

Management Action Plans

- Complete Initial Dispatcher Resource Book.
- Establish Recertification Program for all TCC roles, in consultation with TTC's Employee Relations.
- Complete Training Facilitator Guide with practical scenario-based resources and instructions.
- Complete Dispatcher Refresher Program.
- Target Completion: Q4 2024.

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

Observation #7 – Departmental Performance Audits (M)

Observations and Implications

- Controls that ensure departmental performance audits are completed consistently, equitably and in accordance with established TCC Management expectations need to be put in place and followed.

Recommendations

- Track completion of departmental audits to ensure consistent participation by all applicable Transit Control management and equitable coverage of all those subject to audit.
- Analyze the results of completed audits to identify inconsistencies in the execution of the audit program, flag common issues to be addressed through training or process/SOP updates.
- Consider designating the responsibility for completing departmental audits and issue follow-up to select individuals to increase audit completion rate and consistency, allow timely coaching, and avoid overloading applicable Transit Control Managers.

Management Action Plans

- SOP on departmental performance audits reviewed as part of TCC's broader SOP review project (see Observation 5).
- Review and revise departmental performance audit.
- Engage other transit agencies and identify industry best practices to build a more robust, self-audit program appropriate for an emergency control centre.
- Target Completion: Q1 2025.

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

REPORT: Transit Security Review (Issued – March 2024)

Observation #1 – Departmental Annual Plans (H)

Observations and Implications

- TTC's new approach to safety and security articulated in the TTC Corporate Plan 2024-2028 outlines a multidisciplinary approach to security, thus resulting in changes in expectations around how SCS delivers service.
- A comprehensive and consolidated annual departmental plan that is aligned with the Corporate Plan and includes measurable goals and objectives needs to be developed for desired outcomes: including, for example, enhancing customer satisfaction, preventing and reducing crime and victimization, enhancing safety and order on the system, engaging with reliable multidisciplinary partners, using force sparingly and fairly, and using public funds efficiently.

Recommendations

- Management should prepare a comprehensive and consolidated departmental annual plan with goals and objectives aligned with the Corporate Plan.
- The plan should outline desired annual safety outcomes, risks to achieving these objectives, actions planned to manage these risks, and measures to track performance to desired outcomes.

Management Actions

- Management has appointed an Executive Director to support services in Farecard, Revenue Operations, Revenue Protection and Special Constable Service.
- Management has initiated a longer-term security assessment of all TTC community safety and security operations, security assets and resources as well as a best practice review from other jurisdictions.
- On completion of this assessment, Management will prepare a 2025 Annual Plan, in parallel with the 2025 budgeting process that outlines goals, objectives, risks, actions, and targets and performance measures for desired service outcomes.
- Target Completion: Q1 2025.

Observation #2 – TSC Attrition Rate (H)

Observations and Implications

- Efforts to reduce TSC attrition rate should continue to ensure effective deployment of TSCs for incident response.
- Consider documenting and analyzing reasons for high TSC turnover using comprehensive exit interviews and addressing root causes of controllable attrition.

Recommendations

- Conduct comprehensive exit interviews to track and evaluate possible root causes.
- Consider mitigation strategies, such as over-hiring, establishing minimum period of service stipulations, creating secondment or other career development opportunities to encourage TSC retention.

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

Management Actions

- Management conducted a comprehensive review in 2023 to reduce the recruitment and training period to 20 weeks from 36 weeks by automating and streamlining processes.
- Management will plan and conduct comprehensive exit interviews and will provide summarized, anonymized results of these exit interviews in its 2024 Annual Report.
- In addition, Management will address controllable causes identified in ongoing exit interviews as opportunities and resources permit.
- Target Completion: Q2 2024.

Observation #3 – SCSRP Data Quality (M)

Observations and Implications

- There is opportunity to improve the accuracy, completeness, and consistency of 'calls for service' data in the Special Constables Service Revenue Protection System (SCSRP).
- The system also does not provide the functionality of currently available applications used in enforcement, such as real-time information capture (eliminating inefficient manual memo books), GPS location tracking, and integration with other systems.

Recommendations

- Enhanced data input and supervisory controls will improve the accuracy, completeness, and consistency of calls for service data in the Special Constable Service and Revenue Protection System.
- Technology needs should be assessed to ensure SCS can meet heightened expectations for safety and security event reporting.

Management Actions

- Management will add a Data Quality Assurance Analyst position to improve SCSRP data quality.
- The Crime Analyst position will be filled. This position will work on reviewing reporting needs, identifying missing database fields or features, and enhancing crime and safety event reporting through changes in SCSRP or the MicroStrategy reporting application.
- Management will provide training for reports.
- Supervisors will provide oversight and supervision to ensure data quality.
- On completion of the longer-term security assessment, Management will evaluate and assess recommendations relating to support systems and
- Target Completion: Q1 2025.

Observation #4 – Security Event Classification Guideline (M)

Observations and Implications

- The TTC follows the Criminal Code of Canada classification system for offences reported.

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

- The non-offences City Dashboard reporting is new, started in July 2023, and uses the “calls for service” data in SCSRP.
- However, there is no documented corporate-wide guideline for defining and classifying reportable security events that outlines how data needs to be captured to accurately and consistently classify and report events.

Recommendations

- The TTC should have a corporate guideline for defining and classifying safety and security events to improve the consistency and quality of event data reporting and facilitate trending analyses.

Management Actions

- Management will work in collaboration with the TTC’s internal and external stakeholders to:
 - Define Community Safety and Security reporting needs;
 - Identify appropriate sources of data to support these reporting needs; and
 - Agree and document a TTC-wide definition of categories and classifications of criminal and other offences.
- Target Completion: Q4 2024.

Observation #5 – Tracking/Reporting Response Times (M)

Observations and Implications

- SCS’ progress to regularly report response times needs to continue and include establishing baseline service level standards.
- Procedural expectations and responsibilities of TSC’s who remain on scene when TPS is already present and actively resolving an incident and/or when internal stakeholders, such as Station Supervisors are on scene, should be clarified.

Recommendations

- Each segment of a response time (i.e. from the acceptance of a call to reaching the crime scene, and time at the scene) should be tracked to record baselines of times taken to respond and report response times achieved over a period.
- These should then be routinely measured and monitored to inform staffing, deployment, and opportunities for service improvement.

Management Actions

- Management will commence improving data capture of time in SCSRP once the Data QA Analyst is onboarded.
- Regular monthly reporting of response times will begin as soon as the data quality of calls for service, offence and incident data is improved.
- SCS will track response times over a period to assess and analyze performance of response times and track baselines of times to respond to incidents.
- SCS will continue hiring and onboarding all budgeted Special Constables positions.
- Target Completion: Q4 2024.

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

Observation #6 – Key Performance Measures (M)

Observations and Implications

- SCS monitors day-to-day activities of its section through supervisory field visits, Morning Reports, review of daily log entries, and other periodic reviews of Provincial Offence Tickets.
- The SCS does not have metrics and monthly monitoring of performance indicators to measure the efficiency and effectiveness of its response processes (i.e. time to respond to and close incidents).

Recommendations

- SCS should set and monitor appropriate leading and lagging performance measures to ensure ongoing improvement in efficiency and effectiveness of its incident response process.

Management Actions

- Management has initiated a longer-term security assessment of all TTC community safety and security operations, security assets and resources as well as a best practice review from other jurisdictions.
- On completion of this assessment, Management will prepare a 2025 Annual Plan, in parallel with the 2025 budgeting process outlining goals, objectives, risks, actions, and targets and performance measures for desired service outcomes.
- Target Completion: Q1 2025.

Observation #7 – Calls Cleared on Route (M)

Observations and Implications

- There are opportunities to analyze, identify and control factors for lost time due to “calls cleared on route”. Not analyzing factors for lost time may result in reduced availability of officers to respond to events or provide high-visibility presence.
- ARC noted a high number of calls that TSCs accepted that were cleared on route before the TSC arrived on scene.

Recommendations

- SCS should analyze calls cleared on route to identify controllable factors resulting in TSCs not reaching the scene on time.
- Appropriate changes can then be made to improve deployment and dispatching practices.

Extracts of Issued ARC Reports

Management Actions

- Management will commence improving data capture in SCSRP once the Data QA Analyst is onboarded.
- Regular monthly reporting of response times will begin as soon as the data quality of offence and incident data is improved.
- SCS will commence tracking of 'calls cleared on route' time lost over 2024 to assess and analyze performance and identify areas for improving performance and reducing time lost due to inability to get to the scene on time.
- Target Completion: Q4 2024.